

NASSAU COUNTY
BUS TRANSIT COMMITTEE
MEETING

Nassau Inter-County Express
700 Commercial Avenue
Garden City, New York 11530
February 16, 2017
3:05 P.M.

BEFORE: SHELDON SHRENKEL, CHAIRMAN

COMMITTEE MEMBERS PRESENT:

SAMUEL LITTMAN, ESQ.
JOEL BERSE
JEAN DUROSEAU
LIVIO TONY ROSARIO
AARON WATKINS-LOPEZ
DAWN FALCO

1

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
2 minutes of our public record. By a show
3 of hands, for the committee members, I
4 would like an acknowledgment of receipt
5 of the transcript of our meeting of
6 December 8, which was a public hearing?
7 (All members raise hands.)

8 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Please record
9 the minutes unanimously?

10 I would like an acknowledgment of
11 receipt of the Title VI, Service Equity
12 Analysis found in the book here, together
13 with an acknowledgement of receipt of
14 customer comments within the package.

15 (All members raise hands.)

16 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Thank you.
17 Everybody all set up over there?

18 MR. LITTMAN: Mr. Chairman, the
19 record should reflect that all the
20 members indicated that they received a
21 copy.

22 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Yes. Thank you.

23 UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Try moving the
24 microphone over here a little bit.

25 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: You still can't

3

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
2 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Would everybody
3 please take their seat? Thank you very
4 much. Welcome, welcome to the first
5 public hearing today for the Nassau
6 County Bus Transit Committee. We have
7 another public hearing tonight scheduled
8 at 6:00. First to remind myself and can
9 you please put your cell phones on
10 vibrate. Thank you.

11 I'm Sheldon Shrenkel. I'm the
12 chairman of the committee. I would like
13 to introduce our members of the
14 committee. To my far left is Dawn Falco.

15 MS. FALCO: Good afternoon.

16 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Mr. Aaron
17 Watkins-Lopez.

18 MR. WATKINS-LOPEZ: Good afternoon.

19 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Mr. Tony
20 Rosario.

21 MR. ROSARIO: Good afternoon.

22 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Mr. Jean
23 Duroseau. Mr. Joel Berse. Counsel for
24 the committee, Mr. Sam Littman. Thank
25 you, Kathleen Anderson, for taking the

2

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
2 hear me? Thank you. This is such a
3 small room most of the time I don't even
4 use a microphone and everyone hears me.

5 UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Sometimes you have
6 people with hearing disabilities.

7 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: We will try to
8 use the microphone and if any committee
9 members need the microphone, it seems
10 like they are all close to one.

11 This afternoon, our agenda is to
12 first hear a presentation by the CEO of
13 NICE Transportation, Mr. Michael Setzer.
14 After which we will give virtually
15 everyone an opportunity to speak, to hear
16 the public comments concerning Mr.
17 Setzer's presentation and/or your
18 comments otherwise concerning NICE
19 Transportation. We do ask in these
20 public comments that we have rules and
21 the rule is, we have a three minute rule,
22 and we have two public hearings today, so
23 please think about what you have to say,
24 so that you can say it in three minutes
25 and the same rules will apply to any

4

<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1</p> <p>2 public officials, who may attend the</p> <p>3 hearing, whether it's this afternoon or</p> <p>4 this evening. So with that, I would like</p> <p>5 to introduce the chairman of NICE</p> <p>6 Transportation, Mr. Michael Setzer.</p> <p>7 MR. SETZER: Thank you, Mr.</p> <p>8 Chairman, and good afternoon, members of</p> <p>9 the committee. I would like to welcome</p> <p>10 everybody from the public and see some of</p> <p>11 our elected officials here and I very</p> <p>12 much appreciate your interest and your</p> <p>13 participation in this.</p> <p>14 I would like -- the agenda, as you</p> <p>15 mentioned, includes a budget presentation</p> <p>16 but we've got a proposal to change</p> <p>17 service. I have a couple of other items</p> <p>18 that I would like to cover quickly that</p> <p>19 aren't strictly speaking budget items,</p> <p>20 but they do bear on the budget a little</p> <p>21 bit, tangentially at least. The first is</p> <p>22 I would also like to report on the</p> <p>23 weather last week, as you recall on</p> <p>24 Thursday we had a pretty fair snowstorm</p> <p>25 on top of a slight coating of ice and it</p> <p style="text-align: right;">5</p>	<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1</p> <p>2 will probably be more agencies, but those</p> <p>3 are the six we're starting with. Each of</p> <p>4 those agencies has a supply of free two</p> <p>5 ride MetroCards useable on any NICE Bus.</p> <p>6 Unfortunately, they don't provide a</p> <p>7 transfer to MTA buses, but they're</p> <p>8 available through those agencies to their</p> <p>9 clients. This is an effort to make sure,</p> <p>10 as the title says, everyone who needs a</p> <p>11 bus, can ride NICE. It is -- we use 2016</p> <p>12 money, but it actually provides a little</p> <p>13 bit of a benefit in 2017 in that it comes</p> <p>14 back into NICE in the form of fare</p> <p>15 revenue. Also, I would like to report on</p> <p>16 the delivery now of five new articulated</p> <p>17 buses. These have been received, they</p> <p>18 are on the property here, they are about</p> <p>19 to be inspected and we presume approved,</p> <p>20 by the New York State DOT, which is a</p> <p>21 mandatory approval, and they will go into</p> <p>22 service in April. Along with the April</p> <p>23 service changes, these also were</p> <p>24 purchased with 2016 dollars, and while</p> <p>25 they make only a small contribution, they</p> <p style="text-align: right;">7</p>
<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1</p> <p>2 really affected bus service. We ended up</p> <p>3 beginning to curtail service midday and</p> <p>4 had all of the service in off the street</p> <p>5 about 6:00 PM that night. Lots of</p> <p>6 accidents, 17 of them, none of them</p> <p>7 serious, no injuries, that's good, but it</p> <p>8 taught us a lesson about how challenging</p> <p>9 it is to operate in the snow. The day</p> <p>10 before it was like April, and that's what</p> <p>11 you see in this picture. That was the</p> <p>12 kickoff day for the Everyone Rides NICE</p> <p>13 Organization. Everyone Rides NICE is a</p> <p>14 not-for-profit corporation. It's</p> <p>15 separate from NICE Bus. It's funded with</p> <p>16 a million-two from Transdev, and it's</p> <p>17 purpose is to distribute free MetroCards</p> <p>18 to low income people through several</p> <p>19 agencies that are in touch with their</p> <p>20 clients. So in this picture you see our</p> <p>21 partner, the United Way of Long Island,</p> <p>22 who administers this program with us.</p> <p>23 And who distributes the free MetroCards</p> <p>24 to the six agencies whose logos appear on</p> <p>25 the screen right now. Eventually there</p> <p style="text-align: right;">6</p>	<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1</p> <p>2 actually help our efficiency a little</p> <p>3 bit. We'll use them on the Route 6 which</p> <p>4 is the busiest route in the system. They</p> <p>5 will be full immediately. They provide a</p> <p>6 little improvement in efficiency, in that</p> <p>7 the most of the cost of operating a bus</p> <p>8 is the professional driving that bus,</p> <p>9 when he or she has 60 seats behind him</p> <p>10 instead of 40 seats, it's just a more</p> <p>11 efficient operation, so it also bears</p> <p>12 very tangentially on the 2017 budget, so</p> <p>13 I wanted to bring them up just as news</p> <p>14 items for you. We also have our regular</p> <p>15 quarterly review of the key performance</p> <p>16 indicators. These are the indicators</p> <p>17 that are specified by the contract.</p> <p>18 Three of them for fixed route and five of</p> <p>19 them for Paratransit. We look at them</p> <p>20 each quarter and we've set goals which</p> <p>21 you see in the second column and then if</p> <p>22 the actual performance is either five</p> <p>23 percent more or five percent less than</p> <p>24 the established goal, then something</p> <p>25 happens, either we earn an incentive or</p> <p style="text-align: right;">8</p>

<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1 2 we owe you, we owe the county liquidated 3 damages in the amount of \$5,000. So this 4 is the year end report. I will just go 5 over it real quickly. On-time 6 performance of a fixed route, goal 70 7 percent, we're hitting right around 70 8 percent. Next month we're going to do a 9 more detailed presentation on on-time 10 performance because it is actually 11 getting significantly better through some 12 of the technology that we have discussed 13 in the past. The second goal is missed 14 pullouts on fixed routes. The goal is to 15 have none, we are close to none. No -- 16 not enough to reach the five percent 17 threshold, so there is neither a 18 liquidated damage nor an incentive there. 19 And we have the safety goal accidents per 20 hundred thousand miles of 1.20 accidents 21 per hundred thousand miles. We just 22 barely made that goal this year, but we 23 did make the goal, so again, no 24 incentives or no liquidated damages. 25 Paratransit, there are five different</p> <p style="text-align: right;">9</p>	<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1 2 under one, which earns us a \$5,000 3 incentive credit. And the last thing, 4 productivity passengers per hour 1.3, 5 passengers per hour, we're right around 6 that, either five percent over or under. 7 So for the year the net was \$10,000 8 credits earned by Transdev, which are 9 just credits, it's not cash, those are 10 credits that we can bank for a while to 11 use, if we ever have to have something to 12 pay liquidated damages. At some future 13 meeting, this is our first full year of 14 using these incentives, so at some future 15 meeting when we don't have as much on the 16 agenda, I would like to go over these in 17 detail and we will consider whether those 18 goals are too high or too low and how you 19 might want to change them. But for now 20 this just is with the fourth quarter year 21 end report. 22 So now I would like to get into the 23 main subject for today's meeting, that's 24 the annual plan and budget for 2017. And 25 there are some significant service</p> <p style="text-align: right;">11</p>
<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1 2 goals. The first one is calls answered 3 ratio, 90 percent, we missed that goal, 4 so we owe you a \$5,000 liquidated damage 5 payment for missing that goal. And 6 on-time performance, however, we exceeded 7 the goal of 70 percent by more than five 8 percent, so we earn a \$5,000 credit which 9 we can use to pay that. Missed pullouts, 10 goal is zero, it was actually a little 11 bit higher because there was some fleet 12 problems this year which are pretty much 13 behind us now because of a new fleet, but 14 it also doesn't rise to the five percent 15 threshold. By the way, missed pullouts 16 and Paratransit do not mean that a 17 passenger was not carried. It means that 18 a bus that was scheduled to go out the 19 gate didn't at the right time, but those 20 trips were then rescheduled on to other 21 vehicles that were already in service, so 22 it doesn't mean an abandoned passenger. 23 Accidents per hundred thousand miles, 24 again, the goal is 1.2, we beat that by a 25 lot. By the end of the year we were</p> <p style="text-align: right;">10</p>	<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1 2 changes associated, which I will ask you 3 to consider later today. Let me update 4 you to begin with. In December we had a 5 meeting anticipating the 2017 budget and 6 at that point you considered what was 7 then a proposed \$6.8 million dollar 8 reduction in county funding, the budget 9 hasn't been adopted yet or hasn't been 10 approved. You also heard about some 11 likely increases in our operating costs 12 in 2017. We proposed a program of early 13 service reductions to take place in 14 January, last month, in order to get a 15 head-start on the budget deficits that we 16 had, and you rejected those, and we also 17 reviewed the range of unknowns that we 18 were dealing with at that time. This is 19 the slide that was up on the screen about 20 the unknown factors. The STOA, which is 21 the State Operating Assistance, it's the 22 largest single source of revenue for NICE 23 Bus, was unknown at that time, the 24 governor's budget had not been published. 25 The legislature hadn't begun the budget</p> <p style="text-align: right;">12</p>

<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1</p> <p>2 process. We also didn't know what the</p> <p>3 MTA was going to do with the MetroCard</p> <p>4 charges which does have an effect on our</p> <p>5 revenue. We also knew we were facing a</p> <p>6 new collective bargaining agreement to</p> <p>7 take effect in the spring of this year</p> <p>8 and of course, at that time negotiations</p> <p>9 hadn't begun, so we didn't know what</p> <p>10 effect that would have on our costs,</p> <p>11 still don't, and there was not, at that</p> <p>12 point, an approved 2017 county budget.</p> <p>13 As you recall, probably the county was</p> <p>14 going back and forth with NIFA and we</p> <p>15 didn't know for sure what the budget was</p> <p>16 going to be.</p> <p>17 Let's update that a little bit. You</p> <p>18 added another one. You also added the</p> <p>19 potential of new money. You were</p> <p>20 persuaded that there might be some new</p> <p>21 money coming from some source before too</p> <p>22 long, so that was, I think, that was the</p> <p>23 primary basis for rejecting the changes.</p> <p>24 Let's update on all those unknowns.</p> <p>25 STOA, at the governor's budget has</p> <p style="text-align: right;">13</p>	<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1</p> <p>2 while that remains a possibility that</p> <p>3 that could change, it's my view, at</p> <p>4 least, that it's very unlikely to change</p> <p>5 in any significant way. Not enough to</p> <p>6 solve our problem. We did get a</p> <p>7 resolution on the MTA MetroCard rate,</p> <p>8 they -- basically they raised the prices</p> <p>9 of the MetroCard, and so there is nothing</p> <p>10 that the BTC needs to do. We will garner</p> <p>11 about 800,000 more fare box revenue as a</p> <p>12 result of increases in the price of the</p> <p>13 MetroCard. Don't be confused, the base</p> <p>14 fare stayed the same, but the discount on</p> <p>15 the pay per ride cards was reduced, which</p> <p>16 is effectively a price increase, and the</p> <p>17 price of the seven and thirty day cards</p> <p>18 actually went up, so we will get a little</p> <p>19 bit of the benefit out of that. The new</p> <p>20 collective bargaining agreement is no</p> <p>21 where near resolution. Negotiations have</p> <p>22 just begun. We had one meeting, so we</p> <p>23 got no further information about what to</p> <p>24 expect on the operating costs on it.</p> <p>25 Since that time the county budget has</p> <p style="text-align: right;">15</p>
<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1</p> <p>2 been published in late January. There is</p> <p>3 no increase of STOA for Nassau County or</p> <p>4 any other transit system in the state.</p> <p>5 Everyone was kept at the same level</p> <p>6 except for the MTA, which actually went</p> <p>7 down by a very small increment. Most</p> <p>8 state programs were kept at the same</p> <p>9 level as 2016. The STOA amount could</p> <p>10 still change. It is possible. Because</p> <p>11 the legislature hasn't adopted the</p> <p>12 budget, and as you probably know, the</p> <p>13 process is the governor publishes the</p> <p>14 executive budget, the legislature works</p> <p>15 on it for awhile and comes back with</p> <p>16 proposed changes and the governor either</p> <p>17 accepts those or vetoes it and sends it</p> <p>18 back. As of today there is no new money</p> <p>19 in the state budget for Nassau County,</p> <p>20 NICE Bus or any other bus in the state.</p> <p>21 I have been to Albany several times since</p> <p>22 then, it is a very difficult year to get</p> <p>23 increases in the state budget in</p> <p>24 anything. Most other state programs are</p> <p>25 also zeroed out as far as increases, so</p> <p style="text-align: right;">14</p>	<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1</p> <p>2 been approved by NIFA, and the \$6.8</p> <p>3 million dollar proposed reduction is</p> <p>4 still there, and lastly there has been no</p> <p>5 new money, though I visited with many</p> <p>6 local and state legislators and I think</p> <p>7 there's a deep understanding and a full</p> <p>8 concern for the effects that the current</p> <p>9 funding will have on riders, there is no</p> <p>10 new money. There is no new money around</p> <p>11 which we build the budget. There are</p> <p>12 some ideas, some thoughts, but nothing</p> <p>13 that we can incorporate into the budget.</p> <p>14 This is a slide, we all used to look at</p> <p>15 it in the budget discussions in the very</p> <p>16 beginning, this is the balanced budget, I</p> <p>17 call it the balanced budget, this is</p> <p>18 language from the contract which this is</p> <p>19 adopted by law and it essentially says</p> <p>20 that after all revenues have been</p> <p>21 accounted for, it is our obligation at</p> <p>22 NICE Bus to adjust the amount of service</p> <p>23 hours to whatever revenue is available.</p> <p>24 In other words, we have no method to</p> <p>25 finance other than through the revenues</p> <p style="text-align: right;">16</p>

<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1</p> <p>2 available to the county. We can't borrow</p> <p>3 money, we can't deficit finance, we can't</p> <p>4 print money, we are obligated to adjust</p> <p>5 service hours to the available revenue.</p> <p>6 So when we go to balance the budget,</p> <p>7 there are basically three ways you can do</p> <p>8 it, you can increase revenues, you can</p> <p>9 reduce non service costs and if those two</p> <p>10 aren't sufficient to maintain the level</p> <p>11 of service, you can reduce service or you</p> <p>12 must reduce service too. So I want to go</p> <p>13 through it in that order, I want to go</p> <p>14 through what the current situation looks</p> <p>15 like. And my thing just stopped. Sorry</p> <p>16 about that. It seized up here.</p> <p>17 Here's the revenue outlook next year</p> <p>18 based on what we know today. Make this</p> <p>19 full screen. Sorry. Where are the</p> <p>20 technologies, stumbling.</p> <p>21 So here's the revenue outlook based</p> <p>22 on some of the things we just talked</p> <p>23 about. Let's just go line by line.</p> <p>24 First line, STOA, State Operating</p> <p>25 Assistance, no change. It's the same</p> <p style="text-align: right;">17</p>	<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1</p> <p>2 levels to balance the budget, is that as</p> <p>3 you get rid of service expense, you also</p> <p>4 get rid of fare box revenue. After five</p> <p>5 years of trying to economize every place</p> <p>6 we could on service, the kinds of service</p> <p>7 that we have to eliminate now involves</p> <p>8 significant amounts of fare box revenue</p> <p>9 also. So to overly generalize, in order</p> <p>10 to get a million dollars savings, you</p> <p>11 have to get rid of \$2,000,000 worth of</p> <p>12 service because you're also throwing away</p> <p>13 a million dollars worth of fare box</p> <p>14 revenue. We're in to that kind of</p> <p>15 service now and that's the real tragedy</p> <p>16 of doing this, and something that all of</p> <p>17 us at NICE Bus absolutely hate doing. We</p> <p>18 should be and could be and would be</p> <p>19 putting more service on the street to</p> <p>20 serve our customers if we could, but</p> <p>21 we're stuck with the available --</p> <p>22 revenues available to the county. So the</p> <p>23 bottom line here is that the budget for</p> <p>24 last year of \$130.5 million dollars goes</p> <p>25 down to \$121.6 million dollars for 2017</p> <p style="text-align: right;">19</p>
<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1</p> <p>2 amount as it was in 2016, which by the</p> <p>3 way, is the same amount it was in 2015,</p> <p>4 so three years in a row, \$66,657,000.</p> <p>5 The next line Nassau County required STOA</p> <p>6 match, so this is the minimum local match</p> <p>7 in order to earn that in order to get</p> <p>8 that state money, so that remains at</p> <p>9 \$2,539,000, again no change there.</p> <p>10 Nassau County discretionary share, I</p> <p>11 would call it, goes from \$6,751,000 to</p> <p>12 zero. This is the \$6.8 million dollar</p> <p>13 reduction that I was talking about a</p> <p>14 minute ago. The MTA amounts are</p> <p>15 essentially formula, there is no</p> <p>16 opportunity to dramatically increase</p> <p>17 revenue from there. Passenger revenue,</p> <p>18 this is the one that may surprise you.</p> <p>19 Passenger revenue is going down. This is</p> <p>20 the net effect of the increase in the</p> <p>21 MetroCard rates and the loss of revenue</p> <p>22 that is associated with the service</p> <p>23 changes that I'm going to talk to you</p> <p>24 about in just a minute. One of the</p> <p>25 ironies or tragedies of using service</p> <p style="text-align: right;">18</p>	<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1</p> <p>2 based on all the information we have</p> <p>3 available to us today. Here's a graphic</p> <p>4 representation of the same thing. The</p> <p>5 pie chart, the big light blue wedge is</p> <p>6 the state funding. The dark blue wedge</p> <p>7 is the fare box. As you can see that's</p> <p>8 most of it. The orange wedge is the</p> <p>9 required local match, the two and a half</p> <p>10 million that the county must provide in</p> <p>11 order to get the \$66 million dollar</p> <p>12 state. And the gray wedge is the \$6.8</p> <p>13 million, that's the one that's there in</p> <p>14 2016, not there in 2017. Sometimes the</p> <p>15 picture makes it easier to understand</p> <p>16 what's happening, but that's the same</p> <p>17 information that you just saw, and if I</p> <p>18 can just give you a little historical</p> <p>19 perspective on it, here's what's happened</p> <p>20 and here's what brings us to today's</p> <p>21 situation. The blue columns here</p> <p>22 represent the county's discretionary</p> <p>23 funding in the years up through 2011.</p> <p>24 That's Long Island Bus years, as can see</p> <p>25 it was fairly steadily around eight to</p> <p style="text-align: right;">20</p>

<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1 2 nine million dollars through 2010, and 3 then in 2011 the battle starts and the 4 MTA cancels service, and the county goes 5 looking for a new operator. You can see 6 how it suddenly begins to drop off. The 7 orange columns represent county 8 discretionary funding during the NICE 9 Bus, the five years of NICE Bus, so you 10 can see a little bit of it in 2012, 11 that's the first orange column. None in 12 2013. A little bit comes back in '14, a 13 little more in '15, quite a bit more in 14 '16 and then in '17 right back down to 0. 15 This looks a little bit like a roller 16 coaster, and it is, I'm pointing this out 17 just to be factual, this is not meant to 18 be blaming or indicting or anything, but 19 this is the worst possible way to run a 20 business, I would say. You can't produce 21 predictable, dependable services with 22 this funding pattern, so eventually my 23 plea to everybody, to every elected 24 official, and everyone that I can get to 25 listen, you got to disconnect us from the</p> <p style="text-align: right;">21</p>	<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1 2 our facilities, the Rockville Centre 3 garage, the smaller fixed garage. There 4 are some fairly expensive service 5 contracts there that are associated with 6 maintaining the compressed natural gas 7 system and those show up in the fuel 8 lines. So if we can close down one 9 compressed natural gas facility and just 10 use this one, we can save some money 11 there. This one, a third element is that 12 this one is, we currently have a grant to 13 replace it with a newer, more efficient 14 compressed natural gas facility and in 15 doing that, we have the ability to 16 operate it using some federal grant money 17 for the first part of the year, so that 18 also reduces the costs here and then we 19 found a tax rebate program for using 20 alternative fuels, compressed natural gas 21 in our case and we are applying the tax 22 rebates to this also, so we are able to 23 drive down the fuel cost by \$2.2 million 24 dollars and that should be a fairly 25 reliable reduction because we've been</p> <p style="text-align: right;">23</p>
<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1 2 Nassau County general fund in the budget. 3 We can't deliver what the county needs 4 with that kind of funding cycle, and so 5 some other funding method must be found 6 in the future or we will be looking at 7 this roller coaster again and again in 8 future years. 9 So after you look at revenue, 10 remember that chart, after you look at 11 revenue, the next thing you look at are 12 non service costs. So I'm very pleased 13 to tell you that we have been able to 14 find \$5,000,000 in non service costs. 15 The biggest chunk is in fuel. Now that 16 fuel reduction consists of a number of 17 things. Partly, it's playing the fuel 18 market well. Right now the fuel market, 19 I'm talking about natural gas, the 20 natural gas market is fairly volatile, we 21 have had some very good luck at locking 22 in prices that are lower than last years. 23 That's one component of this. The second 24 component is that we propose in the 25 service reduction, to also close one of</p> <p style="text-align: right;">22</p>	<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1 2 able to lock in some of those prices. 3 The second part of this, I already 4 mentioned, if we reduce service by at 5 least 40 buses, then we can close the 6 Rockville Centre garage and we can reduce 7 personnel costs, and utility costs, and 8 security costs that compressed natural 9 gas service contract and some other 10 things, we can save a million and a half 11 in the remaining eight months of this 12 year by closing that facility. That 13 converts to about \$2,000,000 next year if 14 we remain a single garage, fixed route 15 operation next year. And lastly we found 16 some other miscellaneous savings equal to 17 about 1.3. These involve, by the way, I 18 don't want to go into a lot of detail 19 because these involve some head count 20 reductions which are pretty sensitive and 21 pretty painful, but we believe that 22 before we take anything out of service, 23 we have to be able to say we've taken 24 everything out of non service that we 25 can. So here's \$5,000,000 that</p> <p style="text-align: right;">24</p>

<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1</p> <p>2 essentially offsets completely the</p> <p>3 natural inflation in operating costs that</p> <p>4 will take place next year, I'm sorry,</p> <p>5 this year. The natural inflation costs</p> <p>6 that will take place this year. Like any</p> <p>7 business where the primary costs are</p> <p>8 personnel costs, they go up year after</p> <p>9 year. We have a labor contract coming,</p> <p>10 I'm not prepared to tell you how that's</p> <p>11 going to come out, but it's probably not</p> <p>12 going to reduce our costs. So we've</p> <p>13 looked at revenues, we looked at non</p> <p>14 service costs, now we look at service.</p> <p>15 Able-Ride is, my recommendation is that</p> <p>16 we do nothing with Able-Ride. While the</p> <p>17 service cuts in fixed routes that I'm</p> <p>18 about to show you would make it legal for</p> <p>19 us to also reduce the Able-Ride service,</p> <p>20 I propose not to do that. And from a</p> <p>21 financial point of view, it might seem</p> <p>22 like we should, it's a very expensive</p> <p>23 service, ten percent of our customers --</p> <p>24 one percent of our customers use ten</p> <p>25 percent of our budget, but those</p> <p style="text-align: right;">25</p>	<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1</p> <p>2 that, so during the year we will try this</p> <p>3 out and see if we can make Able-Ride more</p> <p>4 efficient by using taxis for non</p> <p>5 wheelchair trips, and we'll do it in a</p> <p>6 way that's at the discretion of the</p> <p>7 rider, would you just assume have a taxi,</p> <p>8 and if they would, then we will dispatch</p> <p>9 a taxi and using a taxi voucher, they</p> <p>10 will have vouchers, they will be able to</p> <p>11 underwrite the cost of the taxi ride. We</p> <p>12 will see if that works.</p> <p>13 So now we get into the really tough</p> <p>14 part here. In order to close this six</p> <p>15 million dollar, \$6.8 million dollar gap,</p> <p>16 we must reduce the fixed route service.</p> <p>17 We've proposed here, as you will see, to</p> <p>18 completely eliminate ten routes. Some of</p> <p>19 these routes like the ones at the top of</p> <p>20 the list are very high subsidy routes,</p> <p>21 they carry very few people and therefore</p> <p>22 they're a very high subsidy. The first</p> <p>23 one carries about 35 trips a day, and for</p> <p>24 the \$2.75 or whatever the amount is that</p> <p>25 the passenger pays, the taxpayer</p> <p style="text-align: right;">27</p>
<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1</p> <p>2 customers also are, in many cases, quite</p> <p>3 vulnerable and Able-Ride is the</p> <p>4 difference between being isolated from</p> <p>5 opportunity, from job opportunity and</p> <p>6 educational opportunity and being able to</p> <p>7 access those opportunities, so I believe</p> <p>8 we ought to save Able-Ride from any</p> <p>9 further -- from any reductions at all</p> <p>10 even though we could. I also believe</p> <p>11 that we should keep the Able-Ride fare</p> <p>12 the same for the reasons I was just</p> <p>13 talking about as well as the fact that</p> <p>14 Able-Ride fares contribute -- the</p> <p>15 financial effects of raising Able-Ride</p> <p>16 fares is de minimis, it wouldn't help</p> <p>17 with the \$6.8 million dollar problem. It</p> <p>18 doesn't affect the budget immediately,</p> <p>19 but we are going to experiment this year</p> <p>20 with the use of taxis as a way to offset</p> <p>21 some of the Able-Ride costs. We don't</p> <p>22 know if that's going to work or that it's</p> <p>23 going to work or that it's going to save</p> <p>24 us any money, but we entered into an</p> <p>25 agreement to begin experimenting with</p> <p style="text-align: right;">26</p>	<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1</p> <p>2 contributes over \$36.00. For those 35</p> <p>3 people, this is great service, but for</p> <p>4 the taxpayers, it's a very inefficient</p> <p>5 use of their tax dollars. At the bottom</p> <p>6 of the list, it's quite a different</p> <p>7 story, when we get down to the n57, we</p> <p>8 are talking about a service that's quite</p> <p>9 productive, it's fairly productive where</p> <p>10 the riders are paying 25 to 30 percent of</p> <p>11 the cost. So the taxpayers are getting a</p> <p>12 better deal, but still as we put routes</p> <p>13 in rank order, depending on their</p> <p>14 ridership and their -- the amount of tax</p> <p>15 subsidy they require and we go down until</p> <p>16 we get to 6.8 million, we end up with the</p> <p>17 n57. This is where it begins to get very</p> <p>18 painful to remove this service. This is</p> <p>19 valuable service that serves -- I think</p> <p>20 that carries about 600 trips a day. It's</p> <p>21 a small route, but it serves about 600</p> <p>22 people a day. The subsidiaries are not</p> <p>23 bad. But the only alternatives to it are</p> <p>24 even less attractive or even worse.</p> <p>25 There are four routes where we propose to</p> <p style="text-align: right;">28</p>

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 do significant reductions.
 3 UNKNOWN VOICE: Just scroll down.
 4 One of the routes is covered.
 5 MR. SETZER: Thank you, 78, 79,
 6 excuse me. We also propose to reduce
 7 service on four routes, greater than 25
 8 percent, 25 percent plus reduction,
 9 requires BTC approval.
 10 UNKNOWN VOICE: What routes are
 11 those? It's hard for me to see because
 12 I'm visually impaired.
 13 MR. SETZER: I will read them. So
 14 the routes that we propose to eliminate
 15 entirely are the Freeport shuttle; the
 16 Hicksville-Wantagh shuttle; the Rockville
 17 Centre shuttle; the n19, Freeport-Sunrise
 18 Mall; the n36, Lynbrook-Freeport; the
 19 n45, Bellmore-Roosevelt Field; the n47,
 20 Hempstead-Bellmore; n51, Roosevelt
 21 Field-Merrick; n57, Great Neck loop; and
 22 the n78, n79 Hicksville-Plainview. The
 23 routes where we propose 25 percent or
 24 more reductions are the Elmont shuttle;
 25 the n27, Roslyn-Glen Cove; the n77, 71,

29

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 72 and the n80, 81. These changes would
 3 go into effect April 9 of this year which
 4 is Sunday. That's -- and one comment I
 5 need to make is that there's a
 6 significant lead time to adding or
 7 removing services, we can't do it
 8 overnight. There are both public notice
 9 and labor contract provisions that
 10 require a pretty significant lead time,
 11 so the changes can't be implemented
 12 immediately which is one of the reasons I
 13 will be asking you to approve this so we
 14 can begin the work to make these
 15 reductions. If we postpone making the
 16 reductions until later in the year, then
 17 they have to be deeper. Then there's
 18 less time to garner those savings.
 19 Here's what the reductions look like
 20 on a map. The blue lines are lines that
 21 are most -- I left one thing out. There
 22 are also adjustments in service that fall
 23 below the 25 percent threshold that do
 24 not require your approval, mostly on
 25 weekends, and so they're part of the

30

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 route reduction program also, but don't
 3 require BTC approval. On the map here
 4 the lines in blue are mostly unchanged.
 5 They're lines that would get either no
 6 change or change below the 25 percent
 7 threshold. The ones in green are the
 8 ones that would remain, but would be
 9 changed by an amount greater than 25
 10 percent, and the ones in red are the ones
 11 that would disappear altogether based on
 12 this proposal. So if we do all of those
 13 things, the revenue increases that we've
 14 been talking about, the non service
 15 reductions we talked about, and the
 16 service reductions, here's how the 2017
 17 budget would compare with the 2016
 18 budget. I like to go down these lines
 19 one by one. So operator wages go down
 20 because we are running a lot fewer hours
 21 of service, about ten percent fewer hours
 22 of service. Maintenance wages go down a
 23 little bit, and that's because we are
 24 still playing a bit of catch up with the
 25 maintenance and we are beginning to get

31

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 some good results there, but we don't
 3 think we can really thin out the
 4 maintenance work force very much at all.
 5 There will be a little reduction, a
 6 natural one through attrition. Other
 7 ways a little bit of a reduction there,
 8 not very much there to be reduced. Some
 9 of those are associated with the
 10 Rockville Centre closing, if we close
 11 Rockville Centre, we don't need the same
 12 supervisory force there. Fringe benefits
 13 go down because of the reduction in head
 14 count. Services go down and fuel and
 15 lubricants go way down. This is all
 16 those four factors that I described
 17 before plus a reduction in mileage, gets
 18 us over a \$3,000,000 reduction in the
 19 fuel and lubricant line. Parts and
 20 repairs, this is the one thing I really
 21 enjoy on this, we are beginning to
 22 significantly reduce our cost for miles
 23 for parts as our maintenance function
 24 gets better and better, so that's the
 25 main reason that's going down. Other

32

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 materials and supplies stays about the
 3 same. Marketing and legal and other fees
 4 goes down. Utilities goes down and
 5 that's because the Rockville Centre
 6 closing. Casualty and Liability stays
 7 pretty flat. Casualty and Liability, by
 8 the way, is actually not this year's
 9 costs, so much as it is the cost of
 10 claims incurred in previous years. As
 11 you probably know it takes a long time
 12 for a claim to mature and be paid out, so
 13 every year we have to evaluate claim
 14 costs. The fact that it's staying flat
 15 doesn't mean we plan to have more
 16 accidents per hundred thousand miles, it
 17 means that claims that were incurred in
 18 previous years from accidents are --
 19 generally go up over time as they work
 20 their way through the legal system.
 21 Leases and Rentals, nothing significant
 22 there or depreciation. Corporate
 23 Overhead goes down. Corporate Overhead
 24 is a figure that's a percentage of the
 25 total budget and Margin at Risk which is

33

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 hourly rates, so because of the changes
 3 that we've recommended, assuming that we
 4 proceed with those, our monthly fixed fee
 5 goes down. Largely because of closing of
 6 Rockville Centre. The fixed fee covers
 7 those costs that don't vary with miles of
 8 hours of service. Our fixed rate, fixed
 9 route variable rate however, also goes
 10 down. This is something that hasn't
 11 happened before. This is the result of
 12 the \$5,000,000 in savings that we can
 13 squeeze out of the operating budget
 14 before touching service levels. So the
 15 hourly rate for fixed route service is
 16 virtually unchanged, actually it's a few
 17 cents cheaper in 2017. Paratransit, we
 18 didn't find a lot of economies there, so
 19 the Paratransit rate goes up, but not by
 20 very much, 88 cents. So these are
 21 monthly and hourly rates that go with the
 22 \$121 million dollar budget that we just
 23 described for you. Here's what actually
 24 happens to service hours, in fixed route
 25 it's about a ten percent reduction in

35

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 profits before taxes, goes down a little
 3 bit, and also this figure has a -- as a
 4 percentage of the total budget, and
 5 additionally within the extension from
 6 the county of our contract, they post
 7 slightly lower levels on profit in
 8 amounts above \$23,000,000, so I guess it
 9 doesn't really have much effect this year
 10 but it's there. So the total of those
 11 totals are the same ones you were looking
 12 at before, 130 million last year, 121.6
 13 million this year. This is the budget,
 14 that same data arranged as a pie chart,
 15 and I will go through this. This is
 16 driver's wages, this is maintenance
 17 wages, this is all the other wages and
 18 salaries and this is fringe benefits for
 19 all three of those groups, so as always
 20 two-thirds of the pie are people costs,
 21 that's the way the transit business is.
 22 The rest of these are various
 23 miscellaneous amounts, here's profit,
 24 here's overhead. And then these get
 25 converted into rates, into monthly and

34

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 service hours this year versus last year.
 3 That's a significant amount as you saw
 4 when you looked at the routes. In
 5 Paratransit, we're budgeting for
 6 essentially the same level of services
 7 that we provided this year. Paratransit
 8 demand actually went up in 2016, we are
 9 carrying more trips than we did in 2015,
 10 so we are assuming that that trend will
 11 continue in 2017. I would like to end
 12 with this, in spite of all these things
 13 that we just talked about which are
 14 hardly pleasant, not at all what we would
 15 like to be talking about, I think it's
 16 important to keep in mind that the NICE
 17 Bus project that the county and Transdev
 18 undertook together is still continuing to
 19 deliver significant benefits for the
 20 county and for riders. Our costs of
 21 delivering service is a lot lower than
 22 your previous provider. You see the
 23 numbers, an hour of fixed route service
 24 using MTA's current published rates for
 25 bus operation would be about \$216.00 to

36

<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1</p> <p>2 our \$141.00. Even another private</p> <p>3 operator like the Bee-Line in Westchester</p> <p>4 County which is a private company, it's</p> <p>5 been there for quite awhile, is about</p> <p>6 \$40.00 an hour higher than our operating</p> <p>7 cost, so the net result of that over five</p> <p>8 years is \$209 million dollars in savings.</p> <p>9 That's Nassau County L and B's numbers,</p> <p>10 not our numbers. \$209 million dollars</p> <p>11 that you saved compared to the cost of</p> <p>12 operating under the MTA, and that really</p> <p>13 is a better way to think of that is \$209</p> <p>14 million dollars worth of service that's</p> <p>15 then preserved for the last five years</p> <p>16 that would have been gone otherwise.</p> <p>17 So that's the end of my</p> <p>18 presentation. I would be happy to</p> <p>19 respond to questions or comments from the</p> <p>20 committee.</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Mr. Setzer, one</p> <p>22 of the things I was just contemplating</p> <p>23 about, I notice some of these routes, for</p> <p>24 example, go to Roosevelt Field, and the</p> <p>25 vendors of Roosevelt Field and the mall</p> <p style="text-align: right;">37</p>	<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1</p> <p>2 are not allocated, evidently they're not</p> <p>3 coming through for NICE Bus</p> <p>4 transportation and obviously there's some</p> <p>5 other interests who are looking to get</p> <p>6 some of those monies or those monies are</p> <p>7 reserved for other things, I won't go</p> <p>8 into that, but we all know that that's</p> <p>9 what it's about. Certainly I would like</p> <p>10 your approach of a dedicated budget, NICE</p> <p>11 transportation, particularly with the</p> <p>12 fact of percent increases that come up</p> <p>13 with your service contracts year after</p> <p>14 year, and try to avoid these kinds of</p> <p>15 crisis sessions and keeping the bus</p> <p>16 system going and perhaps increasing</p> <p>17 service. So back to my question on the</p> <p>18 corporate sector, what's your thoughts on</p> <p>19 this, and has anybody thought of it,</p> <p>20 would anybody want to do it?</p> <p>21 MR. SETZER: Yes, there are some, I</p> <p>22 don't know about Simon Properties, but</p> <p>23 there are.</p> <p>24 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: I just picked</p> <p>25 them.</p> <p style="text-align: right;">39</p>
<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1</p> <p>2 itself, stand to lose revenue by virtual</p> <p>3 -- people not getting there.</p> <p>4 MR. SETZER: Yes.</p> <p>5 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Has anybody</p> <p>6 thought of asking for grant money from</p> <p>7 corporations within Nassau County and I</p> <p>8 would particularly say, I guess, the</p> <p>9 Simon Company that owns Roosevelt Field?</p> <p>10 UNKNOWN VOICE: Simon Properties is</p> <p>11 the name in Indiana.</p> <p>12 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Yeah, that's</p> <p>13 what I said. So has that ever been</p> <p>14 thought of, considered, is it out of the</p> <p>15 ordinary, is it something that you don't</p> <p>16 think you would want to do, you don't</p> <p>17 know if the county would ask for it, if</p> <p>18 the newspaper would publish it, because</p> <p>19 the corporate sector has a lot to lose?</p> <p>20 MR. SETZER: That's right.</p> <p>21 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: And you can't</p> <p>22 raise fares, we are reducing service, we</p> <p>23 can't find money within the county,</p> <p>24 certain funds within the county, whether</p> <p>25 they're allocated or not, even if they</p> <p style="text-align: right;">38</p>	<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1</p> <p>2 MR. SETZER: If I can just start</p> <p>3 from 30,000 feet, the main reason people</p> <p>4 ride the bus is to go to work. More than</p> <p>5 half the people are going to work. The</p> <p>6 second reason is to go to school, and the</p> <p>7 third reason is go to shopping, to either</p> <p>8 access services or retail or whatever, so</p> <p>9 the reason we have a bus system at all is</p> <p>10 because it's a fundamental part of the</p> <p>11 economic infrastructure, it makes the</p> <p>12 Nassau County economy work. So you're</p> <p>13 absolutely right that the companies in</p> <p>14 the Nassau County have an interest, the</p> <p>15 companies certainly have an interest in</p> <p>16 doing this. Now, there are some programs</p> <p>17 around that where employers can assist</p> <p>18 their employees with providing, by</p> <p>19 helping underwrite the cost of fares,</p> <p>20 that's one way counties can do it. I see</p> <p>21 Rosemary Mascali is here, she actually</p> <p>22 runs one of those programs, maybe she</p> <p>23 will want to comment later. We haven't</p> <p>24 ever gone in Nassau County, I don't think</p> <p>25 we've ever gone directly to retailers and</p> <p style="text-align: right;">40</p>

<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1 2 say you should help us with this. I 3 don't think they would be -- just knowing 4 most retailers, I doubt that they would 5 be very interested in doing that, but it 6 certainly doesn't hurt to ask. 7 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: I would ask a 8 particular, like Simon, that's losing 9 revenues in people not coming. 10 MR. SETZER: Sure. And Simon also 11 depends on a lot of entry level workers, 12 or Simon's tenants, need lots and lots of 13 people at entry level pay rates to serve 14 their stores, to operate the stores and 15 provide all the services that a shopping 16 mall needs, so they may have even more of 17 an interest as an employer or as a 18 landlord to employers than they do as a 19 retailer. And if I could, you made a 20 comment at the end also about the 21 dedicated source of funding, I always 22 like to make the point, one of the 23 differences between NICE and most other 24 transit systems, cite the MTA, is that 25 they have a dedicated source, they have a</p> <p style="text-align: right;">41</p>	<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1 2 MR. SETZER: Yes. 3 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: What are you 4 allocating money for that, if any? 5 MR. SETZER: Not much. Jack, do 6 you? 7 MR. KHZOUZ: Can I hear the 8 question? 9 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: The pilot taxi 10 voucher, did you allocate anything in the 11 budget for this? 12 MR. KHZOUZ: No, we are, at this 13 point, based upon our modeling, it is a 14 wash, in other words, the cost of 15 providing current Able-Ride service 16 versus the taxi service, we've zeroed out 17 each. We think, though, that as we look 18 at the model and understand the model, 19 that we will actually gain some savings, 20 but it's very difficult to model, because 21 it depends on the dead heads. It depends 22 on how many people are on a bus at one 23 time, how we can schedule those, so 24 that's why Mike referred to it or Mr. 25 Setzer referred to it as a pilot, we will</p> <p style="text-align: right;">43</p>
<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1 2 pretty good idea what next year's revenue 3 is going to be and they have some growth 4 built in it. For instance, they have the 5 payroll commuter tax, so even though 6 that's not certain, you can get a pretty 7 good idea what it's going to produce next 8 year, unlike our situation, we don't know 9 what the state is going to do and what 10 the county is going to do from year to 11 year and here we are seven weeks into the 12 year and we still don't know. So there 13 is a real built-in challenge for NICE Bus 14 that most other systems don't have. 15 Every really successful transit system 16 around the country has a dedicated 17 source, it's a sales tax, it's an 18 employment tax, it's a -- something 19 that's built into legislation so that 20 they have a pretty good sense that there 21 will be money there next year, it will 22 grow a little bit and it is predictable. 23 We don't have any of this. 24 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Small question, 25 this pilot taxi voucher?</p> <p style="text-align: right;">42</p>	<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1 2 give it a two month window and see how 3 that performs. 4 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: It could 5 surprise you, a lot of people could start 6 using that, it would cost money. 7 MR. KHZOUZ: We'll have to see how 8 we can mix and use the most efficient 9 routes and filter those rides directly. 10 MR. SETZER: If it's not at least 11 neutral, then we -- it probably won't go 12 on very long. 13 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Committee 14 members? 15 MR. WATKINS-LOPEZ: Just two 16 questions for you, Mr. Setzer. One, what 17 taxi company are you looking to start 18 this program with? Is there a specific 19 vendor you're looking to start the 20 contract with, have you got an RPF out or 21 have you already picked and chose? 22 MR. SETZER: We have been in 23 discussion with All Island Taxi. 24 MR. WATKINS-LOPEZ: Okay. And then 25 -- I want this very bluntly said, right</p> <p style="text-align: right;">44</p>

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 now, you filled the natural deficit that
 3 we had at the end of 2016, at this point
 4 what we are lacking is the \$6.8 million
 5 dollars that the county has taken away
 6 from NICE Bus, I want that to be as clear
 7 as day for everyone.
 8 MR. SETZER: That's correct. You're
 9 absolutely right.
 10 MR. WATKINS-LOPEZ: At this point it
 11 is not a structural issue with NICE Bus,
 12 but the fact that the county is not
 13 providing adequate funding for the bus
 14 service and that's why we cannot grow the
 15 service, yes?
 16 MR. SETZER: It is a funding issue,
 17 a hundred percent, yes.
 18 MR. WATKINS-LOPEZ: Thank you.
 19 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Just a little
 20 counter to that comment is, of course,
 21 you have grown the system over five years
 22 too and increased ridership which creates
 23 additional cost, but yes, comparing it
 24 from last year to this year in absolute
 25 dollars and it just turns out that the --

45

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 definite; right?
 3 MR. SETZER: That's a good question
 4 and a complicated one. If a lot of money
 5 came back, so that we were maintaining
 6 the level of service, then it would stay
 7 open, we would need it. If the amount of
 8 -- if we reduce our peak hour bus
 9 requirement by about 40 buses, then we
 10 can squeeze everything into this
 11 facility. Whether it would be available
 12 in the future, if there were an expansion
 13 in the -- down the road, which is
 14 something we would all like to see,
 15 depends, if the county owns it, it
 16 depends on what the county does with it.
 17 MR. ROSARIO: Thank you.
 18 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Any other
 19 committee members have a question? Mr.
 20 Watkins-Lopez?
 21 MR. WATKINS-LOPEZ: What part of the
 22 budget or the pie graph that we were
 23 given accounts for the money that was
 24 spent to reinstate the routes, because I
 25 know that it was about a million dollars

47

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 the same number that it was raised and
 3 quite frankly it was raised, that money
 4 came through after this committee, well,
 5 we had to have a balanced budget, to cut
 6 the service, and then the money was
 7 found.
 8 MR. SETZER: That's right. If I
 9 could -- that's a very good point, if I
 10 can follow up on that. That is the worst
 11 way to do this, in that when you cut the
 12 service and then put it back, the riders
 13 don't all come back so they were cut
 14 originally because they were less
 15 productive, when they were put back, they
 16 were even less productive.
 17 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Mr. Rosario?
 18 MR. ROSARIO: With the Rockville
 19 Centre closing, so is that a definite
 20 goal or should the money again show up,
 21 is it still a possibility that you would
 22 reopen it again as more ridership comes
 23 back even though you say you lose
 24 ridership, so you're saying that that
 25 Rockville Centre closing is almost a

46

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 that we spent, so was that also counted
 3 in the deficit, is that part of a
 4 specific point in this budget, where was
 5 that money in 2016, where can we see it?
 6 MR. SETZER: Do you mean the three
 7 million that was appropriated by the
 8 county after the year began that we used
 9 to put service back?
 10 MR. WATKINS-LOPEZ: No. I remember
 11 in the budget we were given at end of
 12 last year, there was a million dollar
 13 cost to reinstate the routes, whether
 14 that was making the new schedules,
 15 because I know you said you need time in
 16 order to cut routes and restore routes,
 17 so there was money spent to make new
 18 schedules, there was money spent to hire
 19 the new drivers back, to reroute.
 20 MR. SETZER: Train.
 21 MR. WATKINS-LOPEZ: What was the
 22 cost of that and where is that in the
 23 budget?
 24 MR. SETZER: I don't know what the
 25 exact cost of it was, but each of those

48

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 costs that were associated with that,
 3 like training and driver wages and
 4 printing are all within the existing line
 5 items, it's not set out separately.
 6 MR. WATKINS-LOPEZ: Okay.
 7 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Any other
 8 questions for Mr. Setzer?
 9 MR. LITTMAN: May I ask a question?
 10 MR. SETZER: Certainly.
 11 MR. LITTMAN: Mr. Setzer, what is
 12 plan B if this committee decides to vote
 13 against the service reductions, do you
 14 have a plan B to talk about?
 15 MR. SETZER: That's a great
 16 question, Mr. Littman. I wouldn't call
 17 it a plan B, but I can describe what the
 18 alternatives are. Plan B, let's say that
 19 new money doesn't materialize because it
 20 doesn't seem likely at the moment, then
 21 plan B might be that you would be asked
 22 to come back to a meeting in say April,
 23 and the list of route cuts would be
 24 twenty instead of ten because more of the
 25 year would have gone by, we couldn't put

49

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 of Mr. Littman's question and your
 3 answer, in short, NICE has to operate
 4 within a balanced budget, that budget is
 5 not balanced as of April, Mr. Setzer gave
 6 some permutations, so that NICE would
 7 hang around for awhile.
 8 Are there any other questions?
 9 MR. WATKINS-LOPEZ: Last one, just
 10 the last one, I'm clarifying a point.
 11 The proposed drop in fare box revenue
 12 accounts for the reduction in services,
 13 so this is our projection if we were to
 14 reduce those ten -- reduce and eliminate
 15 those ten routes?
 16 MR. SETZER: Yes.
 17 MR. WATKINS-LOPEZ: That's
 18 \$2,000,000 for the whole year; correct?
 19 MR. SETZER: For the eight months.
 20 MR. WATKINS-LOPEZ: For the eight
 21 months that are left.
 22 MR. SETZER: Yes.
 23 MR. WATKINS-LOPEZ: I'm just, I
 24 guess I'm confused on how we can give up
 25 \$2,000,000 if we still have this deficit,

51

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 them in place until mid year, so there
 3 would have to be more. If you would like
 4 me to go on, plan C would be to eliminate
 5 40 or 24 percent which wouldn't require
 6 BTC approval, 24 percent of most routes,
 7 which would be grotesque is the only word
 8 I can think of, that would mean cutting
 9 vital services to many, many people and
 10 throwing away millions of more dollars in
 11 fare box revenue, but we are still under
 12 the mandate to reduce the number of hours
 13 to whatever the county can afford, so
 14 this isn't a plan or a proposal at this
 15 point, but I am just sort of answering
 16 your hypothetical question. And plan D
 17 would be to do nothing until the money
 18 runs out, about early November, and then
 19 lock the gates. And say, see you all in
 20 January. Even more absurd and grotesque,
 21 but those are the kinds -- I don't think
 22 there's an acceptable plan B. I can't
 23 think of one. There's no nice plan or
 24 easy plan B that's available to us.
 25 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: In furtherance

50

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 if we didn't give up those ten routes,
 3 then that would be two million less in
 4 deficit, no? Or am I just not thinking
 5 about that in the correct way?
 6 MR. SETZER: Well, yes, but the two
 7 million lost revenue is associated with
 8 the seven million dollars reduced
 9 expense. The two million, you can't get
 10 rid of the service and still keep the
 11 fare box revenue. So we've assumed that
 12 of those ten routes eliminated
 13 completely, all of the fare box revenue
 14 that they collect would also be lost.
 15 MR. WATKINS-LOPEZ: Do you have even
 16 preliminary projections of what the
 17 deficit would look like next year?
 18 Because even in the event we cut these
 19 ten routes, because when we did come
 20 together in December there were talks
 21 about having to cut routes a second a
 22 time come June, which we've seen before,
 23 where we either had to raise fares at the
 24 start of the year and then raise fares in
 25 June to make up the deficit, cut routes

52

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
2 and then raise fares, so we have seen all
3 different types of combinations. What
4 would be the projected deficit for 2018,
5 because it just seems to me that we are
6 not actually solving anything, that we
7 are just plugging it for this year, very
8 band-aid kind of approach to it. Do we
9 have any projections for that, would we
10 expect double this deficit? What could
11 we expect?
12 MR. SETZER: Well, this is funding
13 driven -- that's a good question, and
14 that's part of the frustration for all of
15 us at NICE Bus is that because we have no
16 predictability about a couple of the
17 major funding sources including the
18 state, we don't know -- we really can't
19 give a good answer to that answer, so
20 hypothetically, if the state kept STOA
21 the same in 2018 and Nassau County
22 provided only the minimum, two and a half
23 million, yes, we would be back here with
24 a worse discussion than we just had.
25 MR. WATKINS-LOPEZ: Thank you.

53

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
2 for Mr. Setzer? No, okay.
3 MR. SETZER: Thank you.
4 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Thank you, Mr.
5 Setzer.
6 We are going to ask the public to
7 address themselves at the microphone,
8 please, introduce yourself with your
9 name, the town you live in, and of
10 course, the bus route that you're talking
11 about. Sir, red jacket?
12 MR. JOHN TARANTINO: I'm John
13 Tarantino.
14 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Do you need a
15 microphone?
16 MR. JOHN TARANTINO: I'm John
17 Tarantino.
18 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Thank you.
19 MR. JOHN TARANTINO: I live in
20 Levittown. I'm John Tarantino, I live in
21 Levittown. Why I'm here is specifically
22 about the route n72. I take that twice a
23 week to go to a commitment and I need to
24 get out to Babylon. The route, the
25 proposal for it going just to

55

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
2 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Can we go back
3 to our last meeting? What would we have
4 accomplished, of course we kept the buses
5 running, how much would we have saved to
6 cut into that hole had we discontinued
7 the fewer routes proposed back in
8 December?
9 MR. SETZER: We had proposed those
10 routes as sort of an early start on this,
11 hoping that the funding picture would get
12 better, but that it wouldn't get a
13 hundred percent better. We would have
14 saved about \$2,000,000 by having almost
15 12 months of those cuts. They would have
16 been some of the ones at the top of the
17 list, so we would be talking about a \$4.8
18 million dollar hole to fill today.
19 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: So we would've
20 had two pretty busy lines going?
21 MR. SETZER: Yes.
22 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: At least?
23 MR. SETZER: Probably, yes.
24 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Are there any
25 other questions from committee members

54

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
2 Farmingdale, there would be no way I
3 would be able to honor my commitment.
4 There is, I would have to leave the
5 county, I would be no more -- I wouldn't
6 be any value to where I have to go. With
7 that being said, I think there should be
8 some ideas about funding, including
9 contacting Governor Cuomo's office. If
10 the county here can't budget, balance the
11 budget, let the state take it over. Let
12 the state run the county. Maybe they can
13 do a better job than what's going on here
14 right now, if you know what I'm saying.
15 Also, the Trump administration is
16 supposed to be friendly to business and
17 public transit agencies like this. Why
18 not get in contact with them? But I
19 really need this. I really need this 72
20 to go to Babylon. And also, if you want
21 to eliminate waste, waiting at the corner
22 of Hempstead Turnpike and Newbridge Road,
23 I see five n47's at like 5:30 in the
24 morning going by before I see my n72,
25 they're all coming east on Hempstead

56

<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1</p> <p>2 Turnpike making a right going south on</p> <p>3 Newbridge Road. I see a lot of buses not</p> <p>4 in service heading east, that's a waste.</p> <p>5 And if you really want to cut out the</p> <p>6 waste, get rid of the call center. They</p> <p>7 just refer you to the website anyway. So</p> <p>8 just eliminate that, and everybody go to</p> <p>9 the website. Is there -- and also with</p> <p>10 your marketing person, Erica, proposed</p> <p>11 for me to do was to get to Sunrise Mall</p> <p>12 and then have to take three buses. That</p> <p>13 would increase my commute time from two</p> <p>14 to four hours. I don't want to do that.</p> <p>15 And that's each way. So is there any</p> <p>16 help for me?</p> <p>17 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Well, you asked</p> <p>18 a lot of questions, but we can't answer</p> <p>19 many of those, so I want to thank you for</p> <p>20 your comments and with that, is there</p> <p>21 anyone else who would like to address the</p> <p>22 committee?</p> <p>23 MR. JOHN TARANTINO: Please keep</p> <p>24 that n72.</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Thank you. Let</p> <p style="text-align: right;">57</p>	<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1</p> <p>2 unfortunately the people that created</p> <p>3 this mess, I will start with my speech,</p> <p>4 but unfortunately, the people that</p> <p>5 created this mess, namely the Nassau</p> <p>6 County Executive, Ed Mangano, and the</p> <p>7 Nassau County legislature, most of them,</p> <p>8 they're not in this room, they may have</p> <p>9 talked about saving bus service, but</p> <p>10 their actions or lack thereof speak</p> <p>11 louder than words. While I understand</p> <p>12 the financial predicament of the county</p> <p>13 and appreciate the attempts to reach out</p> <p>14 to the state for additional transit</p> <p>15 assistance, time is just about to run</p> <p>16 out. The state doesn't approve their</p> <p>17 budget for months. That won't save bus</p> <p>18 service. I've spoken at the Nassau</p> <p>19 legislature a number of times, they are</p> <p>20 the whole reason the MTA left Nassau</p> <p>21 County to begin with, and now they are</p> <p>22 selfishly throwing the lives of bus</p> <p>23 riders to the taxi wolves and they</p> <p>24 wouldn't even let us hold this hearing in</p> <p>25 the legislature building. That's</p> <p style="text-align: right;">59</p>
<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1</p> <p>2 me remind you, we are under three</p> <p>3 minute rule.</p> <p>4 MR. JOHN MICHNO: Can I stand over</p> <p>5 there?</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Absolutely. If</p> <p>7 anyone wants to go to the podium, we</p> <p>8 prefer it. Do you have a mike there?</p> <p>9 MR. JOHN MICHNO: Yeah, exactly. My</p> <p>10 name is John Michno, M I C H N O. I live</p> <p>11 in Westbury and I depend on the n35 and I</p> <p>12 will say that first of all, I appreciate</p> <p>13 very much this proposal minimizes cuts to</p> <p>14 the bus routes I take, but thousands of</p> <p>15 other bus riders will be impacted. Many</p> <p>16 left with no alternative. Now I have</p> <p>17 come out with some other ideas for</p> <p>18 service reductions if you want to look at</p> <p>19 them, some of them may be implemented</p> <p>20 already, but I figured I can share them</p> <p>21 with you if you're interested, because</p> <p>22 some of these routes, particularly the</p> <p>23 n79 is miles away from any other public</p> <p>24 transportation system, is used quite</p> <p>25 heavily in the Plainview area,</p> <p style="text-align: right;">58</p>	<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1</p> <p>2 shameful. There's plenty of folks that</p> <p>3 drive and think nothing of cutting bus</p> <p>4 service, but people will lose their jobs,</p> <p>5 people will have to drop out of college</p> <p>6 and people will be left prisoners in</p> <p>7 their own home. The arrogance and</p> <p>8 ignorance of so many, however, will not</p> <p>9 make them immune to the effects of these</p> <p>10 cuts. Rise in crime will affect</p> <p>11 everybody and so will businesses having</p> <p>12 to close because they are unable to get</p> <p>13 help and taxes will surely rise due to</p> <p>14 the economic hit. Not everyone can</p> <p>15 afford a car or is able to drive, and</p> <p>16 taxis, you've got to be kidding me.</p> <p>17 These crooks rip off stranded riders</p> <p>18 everyday, they profit a great deal off of</p> <p>19 suffering riders. I wonder how many of</p> <p>20 you have connections with them? I have</p> <p>21 been trying to convince many of the</p> <p>22 importance of the bus system for many</p> <p>23 years, though it seems that only rich</p> <p>24 people are welcome in this county. How</p> <p>25 else are we supposed to feel when our</p> <p style="text-align: right;">60</p>

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 buses are cut and there's more luxury
 3 cars on the road than ever? How can you
 4 understand when only one of you depends
 5 on the buses, Aaron, he's the only one
 6 that depends on the buses. I've pretty
 7 much done everything I can do about this,
 8 all I can say, in conclusion, as you
 9 drive around in your personal vehicles as
 10 thousands of people lose their ride, you
 11 need to think long and hard about what
 12 you're doing when you sleep at night. We
 13 are human beings, we are supposed to look
 14 out for one another and do right by God
 15 and ask yourself, are you being a good
 16 human being. This goes to the
 17 legislature as well as you, obviously
 18 there aren't many members of the
 19 legislature here, but I figured -- I do
 20 have one question though, what if you
 21 vote to approve these cuts and they do
 22 find the money?
 23 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: John, thank you.
 24 Ten seconds. Okay?
 25 UNKNOWN VOICE: Can I ask that we --

61

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 MS. DOROTHY SMITH: My name is
 3 Dorothy Smith. My name is Dorothy Smith
 4 and I live --
 5 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Talk in the
 6 mike.
 7 MS. DOROTHY SMITH: My name is
 8 Dorothy Smith and I live in Garden City.
 9 I take the 24 or the 22 to Hicksville and
 10 pick up the 78 or 79 to Plainview where I
 11 work. Now, if you're going to take off
 12 78 and 79 off the route, what must I do
 13 to reach work on the route 78, 79,
 14 especially 79 to Huntington? A lot of
 15 people travel on that bus. You have Shop
 16 Rite, you have Sears, you have the
 17 restaurant, you have the hospital, you
 18 have the nursing home where we all work.
 19 Now, my question is this, if you are
 20 going to take off 78 or 79, take off 78.
 21 78 doesn't take a lot of people, use 79.
 22 79 picks up 78 people, goes straight to
 23 Newtown, drop off 78 people, come around
 24 and go up Manetto Hill Road to
 25 Huntington, but you cannot take off 78 or

63

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 we have a lot of individuals standing in
 3 the hallway. Can we have them give their
 4 comments first, please, while the rest
 5 are seated, so they don't have to wait?
 6 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: There are
 7 certain people here, however.
 8 (Inaudible).
 9 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Mr. Setzer,
 10 first of all, I don't know how many
 11 people are standing there. Is it
 12 possible to get a few more chairs in?
 13 How many people do we having standing
 14 there?
 15 (People enter the room.)
 16 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Is that seat
 17 empty?
 18 UNKNOWN VOICES: There's two seats
 19 here and here.
 20 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Thanks, Mike.
 21 The lady in the back over there,
 22 yes, ma'am, would you like to come up?
 23 MS. DOROTHY SMITH: No, I will stand
 24 here.
 25 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Your name?

62

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 79. What are you going to replace it
 3 with? How are we going to go to work?
 4 We work, we have our rent to pay, with
 5 light bill, with children, no, it cannot
 6 work. We are small, we are little
 7 people, and I think we are paying our
 8 taxes, we -- we get these people to
 9 represent us, to look after our
 10 wellbeing, right, a lot of old people,
 11 seniors that we have to take care of, if
 12 we don't have any bus to go up, what we
 13 going to happen today, what is going to
 14 happen to us. I cannot pay nine or ten
 15 dollars from Hicksville to Plainview,
 16 nine in the mornings, nine in the evening
 17 that's \$18.00. \$90.00 a week. My salary
 18 cannot afford that, so please check out
 19 and let us know what you're doing. Thank
 20 you.
 21 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Thank you.
 22 Three minutes, please. State your
 23 name and your town.
 24 MR. GEORGE KAPLAN: My name is
 25 George Kaplan. I actually live in

64

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 Manhattan, but I take the n79 to get to
 3 work from the Hicksville railroad
 4 station. The n79 bus is the only bus
 5 servicing the northeastern corner of
 6 Nassau County as is apparent from the bus
 7 map that was shown, and it serves several
 8 important establishments such as the
 9 hospital in Plainview, GEICO, several
 10 shopping centers including Fairway and
 11 additionally, several passengers who work
 12 in the Crossways Corporate Park complex
 13 take the n79 and walk, n79, and walk from
 14 the bus stop, especially since the n94
 15 bus to Crossways was eliminated several
 16 years ago. Now, the n79 bus leaving
 17 Hicksville at 8:45 in the morning each
 18 weekday is almost always full and usually
 19 standing room only. Accordingly,
 20 eliminating this n79 bus will create
 21 extreme hardship on many commuters who
 22 have no other way to get to work, in
 23 addition to causing, as you mentioned,
 24 hardship on many businesses which employ
 25 these commuters and depend on these

65

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 commuters for patronage and shopping.
 3 Now, if bus service must absolutely be
 4 reduced, then one possibility might be
 5 cutting the n79 back on weekend service
 6 and/or midday service and/or late evening
 7 service. Now, another possibility, which
 8 the previous speaker mentioned, would be
 9 eliminating the n78 bus, which operates
 10 only infrequently and only runs a few
 11 blocks past the intersection of Old
 12 Country and Manetto Hill Road where the
 13 n79 bus turns. In fact, several
 14 passengers take the 8:45 AM n79 bus from
 15 Hicksville to the intersection of Old
 16 Country and Manetto Hill Road and then
 17 exit and walk east on Old Country Road
 18 the rest of the way, just a few blocks,
 19 because the schedule of the n78 bus is
 20 not all that convenient. Now, right now,
 21 just to sum up, it's really
 22 counterintuitive to eliminate bus service
 23 when great effort is presently being made
 24 to enhance public transportation. For
 25 example, the Long Island Railroad is

66

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 installing a third track on -- along the
 3 main line in Hicksville. Now, concerning
 4 budgetary concerns, eliminating the n79
 5 bus will clearly hurt businesses along
 6 the route and thereby damage the local
 7 economy and ultimately adversely impact
 8 government revenue, so to sum up, I
 9 urgently implore that the n79 bus be
 10 maintained because it's an indispensable
 11 route for commuters in this part of
 12 Nassau. Thank you very much.
 13 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Thank you, sir.
 14 In the front?
 15 MR. ALLEN ASHERMAN: Thank you. My
 16 name is Allen Asherman. My wife and I
 17 live in Plainview. This is also about
 18 the 78 and the 79 buses. Whenever we are
 19 on the buses in rush hour, we see it
 20 completely filled with people who are
 21 going to work. They are not rich people,
 22 we are not rich people. It is just
 23 unthinkable that the buses will be cut
 24 completely and all of these people will
 25 not be able to get to work. In addition,

67

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 there seems to be something going on here
 3 that is very strange. We got a booklet
 4 from Ed Mangano, outlining all of the
 5 services that are offered to senior
 6 citizens and to various other groups who
 7 live in Plainview, Hicksville and the
 8 town of Oyster Bay, who use the 78 and 79
 9 buses. How can they get there to take
 10 advantage of those programs? How can my
 11 wife and I go to our library, which we
 12 use very often. We cannot walk from
 13 where we are. We'd have to take a taxi.
 14 We'd have to take a taxi every time we
 15 went to the railroad to go to New York
 16 City for business, for medical
 17 examinations, for anything. I see the
 18 faces of the people on the 78 and the 79
 19 buses, most of them don't have much hope
 20 in their faces. Please don't take the
 21 hope they have away from them. Thank
 22 you.
 23 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Legislator
 24 Curran? Three minutes, please.
 25 MS. LAURA CURRAN: Thank you for the

68

<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1 2 opportunity. I'm Nassau County 3 Legislator Laura Curran. And while we 4 are waiting for Albany to decide whether 5 to use a portion of the MTA payroll tax 6 or ride sharing proceeds from Lyft and 7 Uber and the like, we have other 8 opportunities to save bus routes from 9 being cut. These are local solutions to 10 a local problem and I think it needs to 11 be addressed immediately. Yesterday, the 12 county executive announced an \$80 million 13 dollar surplus and \$10.7 million more 14 than budgeted in fines, such as red light 15 camera revenue, so that is 10.7 more in 16 that kind of revenue. More than what was 17 expected. So I propose using part of 18 that revenue, which is recurring, to fund 19 service. Another option, the county just 20 implemented a public safety fee, which 21 you may have read about, which is set to 22 reap \$29 million dollars this year, 2017, 23 going forward, let's commit a portion of 24 that public safety fee, which went into 25 effect January 1, for our buses. I find</p> <p style="text-align: right;">69</p>	<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1 2 use that bus for recreational use, going 3 to Westfield Mall, and I've seen people 4 ride that bus going to work and I can't 5 see that bus being eliminated because 6 then if people wanted to go to Westfield 7 Mall, they have to take -- they have to 8 go to Hempstead Terminal and transfer and 9 get the 54, 55 and that bus takes long to 10 go to the mall or people have to find 11 other alternatives to go to Westfield 12 Mall. They either have to take the LIRR 13 or drive or take taxis or find 14 alternatives. Some buses I can see being 15 eliminated like the 51, I think that one 16 is a low ridership. I've ridden on the 17 bus once, but not too many people ride on 18 that bus. Some of them I can see 19 eliminating, but don't eliminate the 19, 20 people really need that bus. And also I 21 saw they were eliminating the 36, and 22 that's in Freeport also. I feel that the 23 buses that have low ridership, they 24 should eliminate. I can see that, but 25 don't eliminate the 19 and 36, when</p> <p style="text-align: right;">71</p>
<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1 2 it unconscionable to cut services when 3 the county fund balance is many millions 4 of dollars above the county's own limits. 5 Again, a million dollars above what the 6 county policy is for fund balance. I 7 understand Michael may not approve of 8 that, but it's still a policy decision 9 that the administration can make. 10 Furthermore, we have areas of opportunity 11 in the equipment, general expenses, 12 contractual expenses and utility expenses 13 when comparing the 2016 year end results 14 to the 2017 budget. I think if this 15 administration would make buses a 16 priority, we have plenty of funds to save 17 our service. Thank you very much. 18 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Thank you. 19 MS. TONYA WALKER: Hi, good 20 afternoon. Thank you for the opportunity 21 to be able to speak. My name is Tonya 22 Walker and I live in Freeport, New York. 23 And I'm concerned about the n19 as being 24 eliminated because that's the bus that I 25 use to go to doctor's appointments. I</p> <p style="text-align: right;">70</p>	<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1 2 people need that bus either to go to 3 work, go to school, recreational use, 4 even going to doctor's appointments. I 5 thank you for the opportunity to speak. 6 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Thank you very 7 much. 8 MR. TED PRUETT: Good afternoon, my 9 name is Ted Pruett and I live in South 10 Merrick, Nassau County. I'm a disabled 11 American veteran, and eliminating the 12 n19, I go out to Sunrise Mall, I have a 13 doctor out there. I have a doctor out in 14 Babylon. Sometimes I take the 71 or the 15 72 on Hempstead Turnpike out to Babylon 16 or Sunrise Mall. Those are on the 17 chopping block. Also, it's about four 18 miles from where I live in South Merrick, 19 I've been living there since the '60's, 20 since I was a small child and there's 21 always been bus service. I mean once my 22 parents passed away and I didn't have a 23 car, you know, you're really stuck, 24 either you have to walk to the train 25 station or you have to walk up to the bus</p> <p style="text-align: right;">72</p>

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 stop. I live just down the block from
 3 the bus stop on Babylon Turnpike and
 4 Merrick Road, but still it's about a two
 5 to three mile walk to the Merrick train
 6 station or approximately a four mile walk
 7 to the Freeport train station. I have
 8 arthritis, I have a partially herniated
 9 disc in my back, when it's not hurting, I
 10 can walk a couple of miles, but when it
 11 is hurting, that walk would be
 12 impossible. I work by the DMV in East
 13 Garden City, so I have to have a way to
 14 get to work in the morning. It's just a
 15 part-time job and I'm allowed to work a
 16 part-time job there. I believe that
 17 there's other bus routes that have very
 18 low ridership that can be cut, like the
 19 51 or the 45 or the 46 or the 47.
 20 There's also the 48 and 49 that goes to
 21 Hicksville, one of those could be cut.
 22 There's things that can be done. There's
 23 also, I mean I'm not sure who decides,
 24 but whether it's the County Legislature
 25 or the State, who exactly appropriates

73

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 the funding for the bus and how much
 3 money goes to Nassau County. I just
 4 think that there's other areas that can
 5 be cut, because everybody who lives in
 6 Nassau County pays a lot of taxes, and so
 7 I believe that those extra high taxes,
 8 which are among the highest in the
 9 nation, should pay for all the services
 10 that everybody needs, from the Department
 11 of Social Services, to the trains, to the
 12 bus, and to everything else that people
 13 need. This is a crowded urban area and
 14 now people need the services and to put
 15 myself in a position where I have to walk
 16 between eight and nine miles a day,
 17 because I can't afford the \$10.00 each
 18 way in a taxi. That's what it costs to
 19 go from Freeport to Merrick or Merrick to
 20 Freeport. I don't have a hundred dollars
 21 a week. I'm only bringing home about
 22 150. It doesn't make sense to spend more
 23 money on taxis than I'm actually making
 24 at the part-time job that I'm working.
 25 So if you guys can reconsider some of

74

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 these changes, the ones that are low
 3 ridership, go ahead, cut those. I mean
 4 really, I named a few bus routes, but the
 5 n19 that affects the entire south shore
 6 of Long Island from Massapequa Park,
 7 Massapequa, Wantagh, Seaford, Bellmore,
 8 Merrick, parts of Freeport, you can't
 9 screw over all those people, you have to
 10 have it. There's also up over Hempstead
 11 Turnpike, those buses run just once an
 12 hour and those buses are always crowded,
 13 so please keep those. Thank you very
 14 much. I have to go catch a bus now.
 15 Thank you.
 16 MR. CORNELL MARTIN: Good afternoon,
 17 gentlemen, my name is Mr. Cornell Martin
 18 and I'm from Long Beach, New York. When
 19 you slash the 70, 71, and 70, it's going
 20 to cost me more money than my paycheck
 21 where I have to travel from Long Beach
 22 all the way to Freeport, and then wait
 23 for the train. And then, after I get off
 24 the train, I got to wait for the S1 to
 25 get all the way to Brush Hollow Road, so

75

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 eventually my paycheck is gone. The
 3 money that I work for, all that money is
 4 gone. And when you take away the rides
 5 that the people need to get back and
 6 forth to work, the people who work hard
 7 for their money, put in 40 or more hours
 8 a week, and then someone messes up or
 9 something went wrong somewhere, it's
 10 going to cost the people a lot of money
 11 and it's going to cost them a lot of
 12 pain. And a lot of people is going to be
 13 hurt and a lot of businesses is going to
 14 fail. Nassau County is one of the most
 15 productive places in New York City today.
 16 But when you take away what we have built
 17 over the years and established, and you
 18 allow one person to destroy it all, then
 19 we won't have a leg to walk on. And I
 20 hope that you come to a decision that we
 21 can come together and straighten this
 22 mess out, so when these people get up in
 23 the morning and go to work, they know
 24 that that bus is running and that
 25 everything is going to be all right. But

76

<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1 2 whatever affects us is going to affect 3 you too, because one day you are going to 4 be looking for that same bus to ride on, 5 and you are going to think about that, 6 that bus is gone because you couldn't 7 come to a decision to save these rides 8 not only for me, but for these people 9 also, and I hope that you come to a 10 decision that you can just turn this 11 thing around. Because like I said 12 before, whatever affects the people in 13 the State of New York, is going to affect 14 you too one day, because one day you 15 won't be riding that car no more, one day 16 you're going to need that bus and then 17 when you think about it, when you go to 18 that bus stop and you know that bus ain't 19 running no more, remember who made that 20 decision. Thank you. 21 MR. ANDREW KLYDE: Thank you, Ladies 22 and Gentlemen, for giving me and other 23 members of the public the opportunity to 24 address you today. My name is Andrew 25 Klyde, K L Y D E. The lifeline of any</p> <p style="text-align: right;">77</p>	<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1 2 destinations like railroad stations, 3 hospitals, restaurants, community centers 4 because there's no money to keep the bus 5 routes going, would be a grave disservice 6 to the community. What about students 7 who ride the buses, students don't own a 8 car or their families work during school 9 hours, they have no transportation to get 10 to and from school. Put kids on the 11 streets, you're leaving them more open to 12 gun violence. What about the elderly 13 that don't drive cars any more, what 14 about the elderly who don't have cars, 15 they rely on public buses to get to and 16 from work, to go to and from homes, to 17 senior centers, to hospitals, to 18 supermarkets. These buses have served 19 the community for many years and many, 20 many people rely on them day after day to 21 get to important destinations. To 22 eliminate the bus routes without 23 providing for alternative means of 24 transportation is shortsighted and 25 effective in no way to serve the good</p> <p style="text-align: right;">79</p>
<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1 2 great community is its public 3 transportation system. People of 4 Plainview and surrounding towns can be 5 whisked into Manhattan safely, 6 comfortably and quickly using the Long 7 Island Railroad, but to avail ourselves 8 to the railroad, we have to be able to 9 get to the railroad station. For many 10 the method of transport is an automobile, 11 but for many others, public 12 transportation, the Nassau Inter-County 13 Express Buses provide the means to get to 14 the railroad station. Public buses here 15 are clean, efficient and come frequently 16 along established bus routes. There are 17 numerous bus stops located along Old 18 Country Road and other major roads which 19 lead to the Long Island Railroad station 20 in Hicksville, which concerns me 21 personally, and other popular 22 destinations on major roads. To 23 eliminate these essential bus services 24 would be a sin. To deny riders the 25 opportunity to get to important</p> <p style="text-align: right;">78</p>	<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1 2 citizens of this community. I say tweak 3 but don't destroy. If you have no other 4 choice, increase the bus fare, combine 5 routes, reduce the frequency of buses 6 traveling along routes. For people who 7 clean houses and offices for a living, 8 bus routes provide an essential means to 9 enable them to maintain their livelihood. 10 You say there are no monies forthcoming 11 from the state legislature, very 12 unlikely. Governor of our state is up 13 for re-election more sooner than later 14 and reportedly has aspirations for higher 15 office and arguably he has an incentive 16 to help supplement the NICE budgets. In 17 conclusion, I am here today to add my 18 voice to the voices of my fellow 19 commuters and I ask you to please, please 20 find funds to keep these vital bus routes 21 going. The future of this community 22 depends on a vital and essential public 23 transportation system. Without the buses 24 targeted for elimination, the system, to 25 say the least, would be woefully</p> <p style="text-align: right;">80</p>

<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1</p> <p>2 inadequate and the lives of many decent</p> <p>3 hardworking people would be unfairly</p> <p>4 disrupted and with dire consequences.</p> <p>5 Thank you.</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Sir?</p> <p>7 MR. LARRY PENNER: Thank you. My</p> <p>8 name is Larry Penner, Great Neck</p> <p>9 resident, transportation advocate,</p> <p>10 historian, former U.S. Department of</p> <p>11 Transportation Federal Transit</p> <p>12 Administration employee, retired two</p> <p>13 years ago. The Rockville Centre bus</p> <p>14 garage, formerly Bee-Line, was rebuilt in</p> <p>15 the late '80s for close to 10 million, 8</p> <p>16 million federal share, 1 million matched</p> <p>17 from the county and the state.</p> <p>18 Subsequently, millions of dollars in</p> <p>19 improvements have been put into that</p> <p>20 facility. The county, based on the</p> <p>21 annual certification of insurances and</p> <p>22 master grant agreement has a legal</p> <p>23 obligation that all federally funded</p> <p>24 transit assets reach their full use for</p> <p>25 life. The county has to engage in a</p> <p style="text-align: right;">81</p>	<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1</p> <p>2 depreciate at a greater rate and will be</p> <p>3 exposed to inclement weather, hardly a</p> <p>4 good investment for the county.</p> <p>5 Reference was made to a \$5 million dollar</p> <p>6 grant, well in reality, the county</p> <p>7 received 10.8 million in federal funds,</p> <p>8 plus match. It's the county's decision</p> <p>9 in their Program of Projects to decide</p> <p>10 how much money they want to spend on</p> <p>11 preventative maintenance. The problem is</p> <p>12 that the county programs more funds for</p> <p>13 preventative maintenance, it's robbing</p> <p>14 Peter to pay Paul, there's less money for</p> <p>15 replacement buses and improvements for</p> <p>16 the capital facility structure, so it's a</p> <p>17 horrible choice. So in the end the</p> <p>18 county can end up owing the funding</p> <p>19 agencies more money than the 1.5 million</p> <p>20 that NICE Bus would save by closing the</p> <p>21 Rockville Centre bus garage. I really</p> <p>22 question the amount of savings in</p> <p>23 day-to-day operation of buses that were</p> <p>24 assigned to Rockville Centre to this</p> <p>25 facility, given the amount of distance</p> <p style="text-align: right;">83</p>
<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1</p> <p>2 formal dialogue and conclude that</p> <p>3 dialogue with the funding agencies for</p> <p>4 disposition of the facility, whether it's</p> <p>5 mothballed or permanently shut down.</p> <p>6 There is a requirement where 20 percent</p> <p>7 spare ratio for any bus operator who</p> <p>8 receives federal funding, if NICE Bus</p> <p>9 reduces the fleet by 40 buses, again, the</p> <p>10 county, the legal owner of the system,</p> <p>11 has to have a dialogue, and conclude that</p> <p>12 dialogue with the funding agencies,</p> <p>13 federal and state, for permission to</p> <p>14 reduce the size of fleet. The Mitchell</p> <p>15 Field bus garage was rebuilt in the late</p> <p>16 '80s to accommodate a fleet for heavy</p> <p>17 maintenance of 325 buses, but only to</p> <p>18 operate 225 buses. To consolidate buses</p> <p>19 from two facilities into one facility</p> <p>20 leaves a longer line outside the apron to</p> <p>21 fuel those buses, clean those buses, and</p> <p>22 store those buses. This facility was not</p> <p>23 designed to store buses from two</p> <p>24 facilities indoors. Subsequently, if</p> <p>25 more buses are stored outside, they will</p> <p style="text-align: right;">82</p>	<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1</p> <p>2 they have to travel to the south shore</p> <p>3 back and forth, I really don't know where</p> <p>4 that savings is going to come from. You</p> <p>5 want to find money? Governor Cuomo says</p> <p>6 he is going to find \$2 billion dollar for</p> <p>7 the mainline third track, we are looking</p> <p>8 for chump change here. Six million more</p> <p>9 in STOA money, where is it? Every member</p> <p>10 of the county legislature and majority</p> <p>11 party, assembly and state senate has</p> <p>12 access to what is known as member item</p> <p>13 pork barrel projects. On the state level</p> <p>14 it is hundreds of millions. I challenge</p> <p>15 our elected officials, program some of</p> <p>16 the money for some of the routes that</p> <p>17 might be closed down. That will keep the</p> <p>18 bus in service. I guarantee that NICE</p> <p>19 will put a free placard on the side of</p> <p>20 the bus, that this route service</p> <p>21 preserved by assemblyman, state senator,</p> <p>22 or member of the county legislature</p> <p>23 through their grant. Thank you very much</p> <p>24 for your time. And again, I offer my</p> <p>25 services to you for more background in</p> <p style="text-align: right;">84</p>

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 your relationship to the federal and
 3 state government. I hope this committee
 4 is familiar with the federal documents of
 5 certs and insurances, master grant
 6 agreements and the whole grant process in
 7 general for federal and state funding.
 8 Thank you.
 9 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Thank you for
 10 waiting. I just wanted to make a note.
 11 Three minutes, please.
 12 MS. ELLEN BIRNBAUM: Hi. I'm County
 13 Legislator Ellen Birnbaum and of course
 14 it's a pleasure being here and just
 15 hearing the presentations, and listening
 16 to everybody, and I understand that NICE
 17 Bus needs a dedicated source of funds
 18 from Nassau County to operate within a
 19 balanced budget, but unfortunately I
 20 believe our County Executive, Ed Mangano,
 21 has not prioritized the bus as being an
 22 important need for Nassau County
 23 citizens. We are trying to help the
 24 public. The public relies on
 25 transportation, and the bus system, as it

85

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 almost 45,000 residents of the community
 3 and many of these people would be
 4 significantly inconvenienced by the
 5 elimination of route n57. There are
 6 actually many people who use this
 7 routinely to go to the train station and
 8 to their homes. This proposal will add
 9 more pressure to the commuter parking
 10 lots, impact workers, home health aides,
 11 nannies, housekeepers, and the families
 12 that depend on them and of course, would
 13 impact the residents, who prefer to ride
 14 the bus rather than drive. I urge you to
 15 abandon this ill conceived proposal. It
 16 is extremely detrimental to the
 17 community. I do believe eliminating any
 18 of the ten routes would be detrimental to
 19 every community that would be impacted by
 20 it, but I implore you to go over the
 21 routes again and particularly the n57
 22 which is utilized all day long, but
 23 mostly morning and evening, so perhaps
 24 there could be cuts to routes during the
 25 day when less riders use those specific

87

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 is, is a public-private enterprise, but
 3 we are forgetting the public, and I
 4 really believe that any bus route that's
 5 eliminated impacts so many people. And I
 6 come here to speak specifically about
 7 route n57 which is in the district where
 8 I reside. That's the Great Neck loop.
 9 By Mr. Setzer's own admission it is
 10 fairly productive, riders pay 25 to 30
 11 percent of the cost and around 600 people
 12 a day use that bus. Those who can least
 13 afford to lose the bus will find such
 14 difficulty traveling to work if this
 15 route is cut, and I have before me a
 16 letter from a mayor, many of the mayors
 17 in Great Neck, which is comprised of nine
 18 villages, are very upset about this.
 19 There is the Great Neck Village Officials
 20 Association and the vice president of
 21 that group is Mayor Susan Lopatkin, she
 22 is from the Village of Kensington, she
 23 wanted me to read to you that as the vice
 24 president of the Great Neck Village
 25 Officials Association, she speaks for

86

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 routes. I believe there's a lot that can
 3 be fixed in the system. The closing of
 4 the Rockville Centre yard would be the
 5 bulk of the cost and I think a lot of
 6 these routes don't really account for a
 7 majority of savings. So I too ask for
 8 you to reconsider the elimination of
 9 these ten routes and specifically the
 10 n57. Thank you.
 11 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Yes, ma'am?
 12 MS. MICHELE DARCY: Good evening.
 13 My name is Michele Darcy. I'm the
 14 Minority Director of Finance for the
 15 Nassau County Legislature and I know
 16 several of the constituents mentioned
 17 that of the legislature is not
 18 represented here today. So I wanted to
 19 just put on the record that obviously
 20 Legislator Curran is here from
 21 Legislative District 5. Legislator
 22 Birnbaum, thank you, from our Legislative
 23 District 10. Also Legislator DeRiggi
 24 from Legislative District 11 has a
 25 representative here including myself and

88

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
2 so does Legislator Carrie Solages from
3 the Legislative District 3 has a
4 representative here including myself.
5 This evening at 6:00 PM, Legislator Siela
6 Bynoe from Legislative District 2 will be
7 here. Legislator Kevan Abraham, our
8 Minority Leader from Legislative District
9 1 will also be here. And Legislator
10 Arnie Drucker from Legislative District
11 15 will also be here. I've been taking
12 notes, several have made complaints about
13 the reductions for cuts to n78 and 79,
14 that's Legislator Drucker's area. I will
15 make sure he gets those, and if you need
16 to contact him and you don't know how, I
17 will give you my business card at the end
18 of this meeting and also n29 is
19 Legislator DeRiggi's area, in LD 11, we
20 will also make sure she gets those
21 comments. Like I said, we're taking
22 notes and we are recording and all of our
23 legislators are being represented, all
24 seven of them, the minority and the
25 legislature. We will be working with Mr.

89

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
2 the way down to the bay. All right. I
3 would like an effort for the walk. It
4 would be good to bring the 62 bus, to
5 restore that. That's no good cutting the
6 buses and that's very evil, to get rid of
7 the buses, that's very, very evil. When
8 they shouldn't be thinking about cutting
9 buses, that's punishment for us. It
10 punishes me and it punishes the rest of
11 them. And those people are a hundred
12 percent right, I really agree with them.
13 I thank some of them for a long time ago.
14 And the 72, sometimes I use the 72 to see
15 some friends too. Because we need the
16 72, and they should run more often, the
17 72. So we have to get the 62 bus back,
18 the n62, which goes Freeport, Nautical
19 Mile. We got to get the 62 bus back. I
20 know people that ride, you shouldn't cut
21 the 19 bus. I see plenty of people on the
22 19, I see tons and tons of people on the
23 19. That's ridiculous to cut the 19.
24 19, I would never cut it, if it was my
25 decision I would extend the 19.

91

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
2 Setzer to address your concerns as we
3 have been, you have been very willing to
4 work with us and I thank you, board, for
5 for letting me speak today.
6 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Thank you.
7 MR. JAMES LAMBOS: Good afternoon,
8 folks. How are you doing? My name is
9 James Lambos. I live in Far Rockaway by
10 the foot of the Atlantic Beach Bridge and
11 I use the 36 bus too. The 36 bus I go to
12 see plenty of friends, 36 bus should not
13 be cut. It's no good to have the 36 bus,
14 that would hurt me and I agree with all
15 the people, there are a hundred percent
16 right, no buses should be cut. Everybody
17 is right, there's tons of reasons people
18 need the buses. Tons and tons, tons.
19 The 36 bus should be running all the
20 time. I know it doesn't run Sundays, but
21 it would be nice if it runs on Sunday,
22 the n36. And the 62, we use to go to
23 Nautical Mile during the week, they run
24 during the summertime. I get off by
25 Atlantic Avenue and make the -- walk all

90

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
2 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Just finish up,
3 please.
4 MR. JAMES LAMBOS: Okay. I have a
5 few minutes. We used to run the Babylon
6 which was good, run by the Sunrise mall,
7 I hope they build the 19 bus good and
8 sturdy.
9 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Okay, sir.
10 Thank you.
11 MS. ROSEMARY MASCALI: Hi, my name
12 is Rosemary Mascali. I'm manager of
13 Transit Solutions, which is a federally
14 funded program of the MTA. Its mission
15 is to improve Long Island's air quality
16 by increasing transit ridership. I also
17 chair the Sustainable Transportation
18 Committee for the U.S./Greenville
19 Council, Long Island Chapter and I
20 co-chair the Car-Free Day Long Island
21 event. As manager of Transit Solutions,
22 I help build awareness of the available
23 transit options by conducting
24 transportation days and many of Nassau
25 County's major employers and colleges as

92

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 well as companies that have major
 3 employment centers in Suffolk county
 4 including Route 110 corridor. At these
 5 transportation days I help employees and
 6 students to find transit alternatives to
 7 get to work and school. I can tell you
 8 from this experience and frankly, from
 9 listening to everyone in this room, and
 10 hearing the same thing, the NICE Bus
 11 service is in many cases the only option
 12 employees and students have to get to
 13 work or to school and for seniors to get
 14 to their medical appointments.
 15 Oftentimes, workers and students take
 16 multiple buses to get to their
 17 destination, so you start to cut some
 18 routes and they can't get to where
 19 they're going even using the other
 20 routes, so I think your revenues are
 21 going to fall in your other routes as
 22 well. Oftentimes NICE Bus routes are
 23 also used by Nassau County residents and
 24 workers as a feeder routes to the Long
 25 Island Railroad station, those comments

93

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 to see what the cost per ride subsidy is
 3 for Nassau County. I was trying to
 4 calculate it, and I think it is somewhere
 5 between ten and twenty cents a ride.
 6 Suffolk County is something like \$5.00.
 7 There is something -- and as a resident
 8 of Manhasset, Nassau County, I'm ashamed
 9 to say that I can only give ten or twenty
 10 cents per ride to the bus riders. If we
 11 are not using the buses or trains and we
 12 are driving our cars, we're contributing
 13 to the air quality. These people here
 14 are helping that. What are we doing?
 15 Really, what are we doing?
 16 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Thank you very
 17 much. Sir?
 18 MR. REIN NAGRONI: Hi, good
 19 afternoon. My name is Rein Nagroni. I'm
 20 part of a Long Island bus union, bus
 21 union here, I'm here from Baldwin, New
 22 York, hear everybody about the complaints
 23 of the proposed cut for the n19, going
 24 from Freeport all the way to Sunrise Mall
 25 in Babylon and n36 to Freeport all the

95

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 came out several times here. The
 3 proposed cuts will affect access to and
 4 from many communities and their Long
 5 Island Railroad stations, including
 6 Rockville Centre, Freeport, Wantagh,
 7 Hicksville, Lynbrook, Bellmore, Merrick,
 8 Great Neck, Elmont, Glen Cove, and
 9 Farmingdale. That's access to Long
 10 Island Railroad or get into the city,
 11 that's vehicle miles traveled that's
 12 impacting our air quality. Elimination
 13 of these feeder routes will exacerbate
 14 also the parking problems at these Long
 15 Island Railroad stations because more
 16 people will have to take their cars to
 17 get to the railroad stations. In
 18 addition to the negative economic
 19 consequences, the reduced transit actions
 20 will have negative environmental
 21 consequences. Nassau County does not
 22 meet EPA air quality standards and cars
 23 are a major contributor to our poor air
 24 quality. Reducing bus options will make
 25 this problem worse. So -- I would love

94

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 way to -- the destination go to is
 3 Lynbrook and that's a really big problem
 4 for everybody in the county here, and
 5 then really bad for persons who has low
 6 ridership, and it's not really good. And
 7 we cut that one, we cut those and it's
 8 going to be jeopardizing the ridership,
 9 and people going to work and stuff, it's
 10 not good and it's going to be like
 11 containing of insubordination, if you do
 12 that, now I don't know if you can do --
 13 if you have contingency plans or
 14 something, I'm not sure, but made this
 15 up, where I'm from, the other part of
 16 town, but here's another one, if I'm not
 17 going to make a statement, which I
 18 forgot, which is the other one that I
 19 know of, I used to go from Queens and
 20 there's the n22L, n22L, actually starts
 21 from Hicksville station to the Jamaica,
 22 Queens and then you have to go from all
 23 these destinations point view going to
 24 the major streets on the n22L, which is
 25 going to like, going -- stop service on

96

<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1</p> <p>2 Broadway, Hicksville, Northern Boulevard,</p> <p>3 Grand Avenue, Bryant Avenue going on</p> <p>4 Northern Boulevard and then going to -- I</p> <p>5 made a mistake here, I'm sorry. That's</p> <p>6 not on the n22, I'm sorry, from the</p> <p>7 Prospect Avenue, West Charles Street,</p> <p>8 Westbury Avenue, to Hillside Avenue,</p> <p>9 that's on the n22L and then you have to</p> <p>10 introduce the different service back from</p> <p>11 January of 2012. And they're the same</p> <p>12 group from the n22 and n28, the corridor,</p> <p>13 like come from the express, to Jamaica to</p> <p>14 Williston Park and then we have, it does</p> <p>15 not serve from the Willis Avenue,</p> <p>16 Roosevelt Field and rush hour service.</p> <p>17 What I would like to say, maybe if I</p> <p>18 could, if you want to restore that</p> <p>19 service, you may, I'm not sure if you</p> <p>20 want to do so, but we need one of these</p> <p>21 contingency plans if you want to get the</p> <p>22 n22L back. Because n22L is from Jamaica</p> <p>23 to Hicksville, if I'm not mistaken,</p> <p>24 because it has the signs, it should be to</p> <p>25 be pointing to that one. If I'm not</p> <p style="text-align: right;">97</p>	<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1</p> <p>2 disabilities and working families will</p> <p>3 not have the means to get around. I</p> <p>4 humbly request that you reconsider making</p> <p>5 these cuts before moving forward. I hope</p> <p>6 we can talk, please call my office and</p> <p>7 anyone can take down this number,</p> <p>8 (516) 882-0630. Thank you for your time</p> <p>9 and attention to this matter. Senator</p> <p>10 John E. Brooks. Please do not eliminate</p> <p>11 any of the following routes, Freeport</p> <p>12 Community shuttle; Hicksville-Wantagh</p> <p>13 Community shuttle, n19 Freeport-Sunrise</p> <p>14 Mall, n36 Lynbrook, Freeport, n45</p> <p>15 Bellmore, Roosevelt Field, n47 Hempstead,</p> <p>16 Bellmore, and n51 Roosevelt Field,</p> <p>17 Merrick. Any questions?</p> <p>18 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Well, you can</p> <p>19 tell him to get the money.</p> <p>20 MS. TAMMIE WILLIAMS: Okay. Thank</p> <p>21 you.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Thank you. I</p> <p>23 guess that ends our public comments and I</p> <p>24 would just like to bring back Mr. Setzer</p> <p>25 for a minute. And there would be no</p> <p style="text-align: right;">99</p>
<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1</p> <p>2 mistaken, if you want to put that route</p> <p>3 back, that would definitely eliminate</p> <p>4 congestion and traffic and that's it. So</p> <p>5 I just want to say thank you very much.</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Thank you. Yes?</p> <p>7 MS. TAMMIE WILLIAMS: Hi, I'm here</p> <p>8 from Senator John Brook's office.</p> <p>9 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Three minutes,</p> <p>10 please.</p> <p>11 MS. TAMMIE WILLIAMS: Good</p> <p>12 afternoon. Senator Brooks and Mayor</p> <p>13 Kennedy of Freeport are both opposed to</p> <p>14 these cuts. I have heard -- and this is</p> <p>15 from his quote, I have heard from many</p> <p>16 members of the community and caregivers</p> <p>17 about our crucial need for NICE Bus in</p> <p>18 our community. It would be devastating</p> <p>19 to see this service eliminated or reduced</p> <p>20 in many areas across Long Island. NICE</p> <p>21 is currently the only means of</p> <p>22 transportation going north and south in</p> <p>23 the county. If the service is</p> <p>24 eliminated, many people in the community</p> <p>25 including many seniors, people with</p> <p style="text-align: right;">98</p>	<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1</p> <p>2 public comments now. And this will not</p> <p>3 be a discussion with him. Unless Mr.</p> <p>4 Setzer, if you want to address any of the</p> <p>5 public comments individually or together,</p> <p>6 by all means, take a couple of minutes to</p> <p>7 do so. I just have two questions for you.</p> <p>8 MR. SETZER: Well, thank you, Mr.</p> <p>9 Chairman. I think I would like to</p> <p>10 address them in the aggregate.</p> <p>11 Most of what you just heard, I have</p> <p>12 absolutely no argument with at all. I</p> <p>13 think what you heard is that the service</p> <p>14 that is on the block here is vital</p> <p>15 service. That it's very important to</p> <p>16 people, that people's lives are adversely</p> <p>17 affected if that service is gone. Many</p> <p>18 people said, well, don't affect this</p> <p>19 service, affect that service, but in fact</p> <p>20 there's no non vital service left.</p> <p>21 There's nothing available to cut that</p> <p>22 isn't very harmful to the people who use</p> <p>23 it. As I said earlier, this is not what</p> <p>24 we want to be doing, we would much rather</p> <p>25 be developing new service and improving</p> <p style="text-align: right;">100</p>

<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1</p> <p>2 and enhancing the service that's there.</p> <p>3 But we collectively, the committee and</p> <p>4 your operating partner are stuck with the</p> <p>5 very unpleasant responsibility of</p> <p>6 balancing the budget and that is, I think</p> <p>7 we all hope, I'm sure every member of the</p> <p>8 committee as well as everybody who works</p> <p>9 at NICE Bus wishes and hopes that there</p> <p>10 were some other way to do this. I assure</p> <p>11 you that everybody that works here is</p> <p>12 appalled at the need to make these kinds</p> <p>13 of cuts. However, to say it one more</p> <p>14 time, we have very few choices, as time</p> <p>15 goes by, and the revenue is not</p> <p>16 available, we can't build a budget based</p> <p>17 on might be available, on promises, on</p> <p>18 that sort of thing. We are obligated, I</p> <p>19 think, as people interested and committed</p> <p>20 to this, to do what we have to do. It's</p> <p>21 unfortunate, I hope something happens</p> <p>22 that it's not, but as I say, we are</p> <p>23 really out of time to continue to hope</p> <p>24 for improvements.</p> <p>25 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Mr. Setzer,</p> <p style="text-align: right;">101</p>	<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1</p> <p>2 check with them in-between sessions here</p> <p>3 to make sure we didn't hear anything that</p> <p>4 we missed before in combing through the</p> <p>5 service over and over again looking for</p> <p>6 the least harmful cuts. It's always</p> <p>7 possible that we missed something. We</p> <p>8 will double check that again, but I will</p> <p>9 be surprised.</p> <p>10 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: The other</p> <p>11 question is the Rockville Centre</p> <p>12 facility, okay.</p> <p>13 MR. SETZER: Yes.</p> <p>14 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: You're moving</p> <p>15 out of it, you moved out of it already,</p> <p>16 where are we?</p> <p>17 MR. SETZER: If the service cut plan</p> <p>18 like we described or something like it</p> <p>19 goes forward that reduces our bus fleet</p> <p>20 then we would vacate it probably in May.</p> <p>21 We would run the current service, which</p> <p>22 requires two garages, through the April 9</p> <p>23 would be the implementation of the</p> <p>24 reduced service, so it would take a</p> <p>25 little bit of time to get everything out</p> <p style="text-align: right;">103</p>
<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1</p> <p>2 based on some of these public comments</p> <p>3 that you heard today and unfortunately</p> <p>4 I'm not that familiar with knowing the</p> <p>5 traffic on all these routes, is there</p> <p>6 anything that convinced you to make any</p> <p>7 changes, not in the absolute dollars, in</p> <p>8 which this committee may have to look,</p> <p>9 have to vote on in our second -- at the</p> <p>10 end of our second public hearing, but to</p> <p>11 sort of make any switches within your</p> <p>12 recommendations, you know, I hear save</p> <p>13 the 78, not the 79 or vice versa, because</p> <p>14 I believe once you're granted these cuts,</p> <p>15 these will be the precise routes of your</p> <p>16 recommendations that will be cut.</p> <p>17 MR. SETZER: They would if, because</p> <p>18 we couldn't cut a route without the BTC</p> <p>19 approval. This is not -- the plan that</p> <p>20 we have on the screen is not something</p> <p>21 that we arrived at quickly or easily.</p> <p>22 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: I'm sure.</p> <p>23 MR. SETZER: It is not without a lot</p> <p>24 of analysis. Our service planning staff</p> <p>25 is here listening to all this, I will</p> <p style="text-align: right;">102</p>	<p>1 2/16/17 - Session #1</p> <p>2 of there.</p> <p>3 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Who owns the</p> <p>4 facility?</p> <p>5 MR. SETZER: Nassau County.</p> <p>6 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: What is that</p> <p>7 facility worth?</p> <p>8 MR. SETZER: I don't know, but it is</p> <p>9 probably a fairly valuable piece of real</p> <p>10 estate in Rockville Centre.</p> <p>11 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: What's the size</p> <p>12 of it, do you know?</p> <p>13 MR. SETZER: I don't know offhand.</p> <p>14 Anybody? It holds about a hundred buses,</p> <p>15 it's a good size facility.</p> <p>16 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Okay. After you</p> <p>17 move out, I don't know if you discussed</p> <p>18 this with the county, what's going to</p> <p>19 happen to that facility, can they sell it</p> <p>20 for money and can the money go into the</p> <p>21 operating budget?</p> <p>22 MR. SETZER: We have alerted the</p> <p>23 county that we may be vacating it and no</p> <p>24 longer needed for transit operations.</p> <p>25 The decisions about how to dispose of it</p> <p style="text-align: right;">104</p>

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 or whether to dispose of it are the
 3 county's. I think as Mr. Penner pointed
 4 out, there are some other obligations
 5 that impinge on the county.
 6 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Is it the
 7 county's obligation in the event this
 8 facility is unwound?
 9 MR. SETZER: Yes.
 10 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: With some
 11 potential liability.
 12 MR. SETZER: There may be, I'm not
 13 sure about that. There has been some
 14 discussions at the county. The savings
 15 that I described coming from vacating the
 16 Rockville Centre garage are just
 17 operating costs savings, they have
 18 nothing to do with monetizing the
 19 property or using it in any other way or
 20 selling it. They're basically, they
 21 basically come from reduced utility
 22 costs, reduced staffing costs and reduced
 23 security and other kinds of services.
 24 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: You're saving
 25 how much by moving out again?

105

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 today. I don't think it's new news.
 3 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: I thought I was
 4 onto something to get you some money.
 5 Mr. Rosario?
 6 MR. ROSARIO: How are you doing, Mr.
 7 Setzer?
 8 MR. SETZER: Very fine, thank you.
 9 MR. ROSARIO: There was a valid
 10 point brought about that if you close the
 11 Rockville Centre, these buses are going
 12 to have to come over here, because of the
 13 closed facility, do you see any more
 14 costs incurred because drivers are going
 15 to be pulling into these lines, these
 16 lines are -- which is a valid point,
 17 these lines are going to be crazy long,
 18 that's going to compensate, bus drivers
 19 get paid by the minute, I know that for a
 20 fact, so isn't that cost going to be
 21 incurred with the overtime and the
 22 ridership of buses coming in and which
 23 are going to pull out for the evening of
 24 the lines that are still going to be
 25 available, you know I'm taking, I know

107

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 MR. SETZER: About a million and a
 3 half this year and two million on an
 4 annualized basis.
 5 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: They are well
 6 aware of this already, everyone at the
 7 county?
 8 MR. SETZER: Yes.
 9 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Are you sure
 10 about this?
 11 MR. SETZER: Yes, the people that we
 12 reported to are aware of it.
 13 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Counselor, will
 14 you note your records accordingly to make
 15 sure whoever at the county is in charge
 16 of disposition of the real estate, the
 17 fact that this facility may be vacant or
 18 potentially sold, if it can be sold,
 19 because there are a couple of things I
 20 think go beyond the scope of the
 21 committee and our knowledge.
 22 MR. LITTMAN: Mr. Chairman, I'm sure
 23 that the people who need to be aware at
 24 the county, are aware and have considered
 25 everything that Mr. Setzer is telling us

106

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
 2 you probably looked at all of this, but
 3 just for the people to know this.
 4 MR. SETZER: Mr. Rosario, that's
 5 right. You know transit operations very
 6 well. There will be higher dead head
 7 costs because of the southern routes will
 8 have to come up here when they pull -- or
 9 leave from here, in the morning when they
 10 pull out or when they come back in, we've
 11 taken those dead head costs into account,
 12 there are also some costs with modifying
 13 the parking arrangements. It's a one
 14 time cost to modify the parking
 15 arrangements, so that we can squeeze
 16 everything in. It is certainly not an
 17 ideal situation, it is far from ideal,
 18 but again, we are in this tradeoff
 19 situation, if we don't take that million
 20 and a half available savings, then it's
 21 got to come out of something else and the
 22 something else would be service.
 23 MR. ROSARIO: Okay, thank you.
 24 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Mr. Setzer, I
 25 have nothing further for you. If the

108

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
2 committee members don't -- do you have a
3 question?
4 MR. WATKINS-LOPEZ: I will be quick.
5 This is less of a question for you, Mike,
6 and more of just a statement for
7 everyone. All of the public that came
8 out today, we appreciate that, and I want
9 you to know that there are three people
10 that you really need to be hounding on
11 their doors, and that is Ed Mangano, that
12 is your local senator and that is Senator
13 Flanagan. At the end of the day, this
14 committee right here, we are appointed,
15 we have no control over the budget, over
16 operating costs, we have none of that,
17 but I can point you in the right
18 direction and those three people can.
19 They have to listen, they should listen,
20 they are your representative and those
21 are the people that you need to get to,
22 because those are the people with the
23 power and those are the people with the
24 money, but I appreciate everybody coming
25 out and talking about the issues on their

109

1 2/16/17 - Session #1
2 routes because we can't hear what's
3 happening on the road, I mean as one
4 speaker did say, I'm the only bus rider
5 here, we don't know, but we appreciate
6 that, but those three people, Ed Mangano,
7 your local senator and Senator Flanagan,
8 who is the majority speaker, those are
9 the three people that you need to be
10 hounding, because they have the money,
11 they have the power.
12 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Maybe NIFA will
13 help understand this is open.
14 I would like to make a motion to
15 adjourn our meeting. We have a public
16 hearing scheduled at 6:00, same location.
17 Would anybody like to make a motion?
18 MR. ROSARIO: Motion.
19 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Mr. Rosario.
20 MR. BERSE: Second.
21 CHAIRMAN SHRENKEL: Second. Thank
22 you. Meeting adjourned. Thank you for
23 coming.
24 (Time noted: 5:00 P.M.)
25

110

1
2 C E R T I F I C A T I O N
3 I, KATHLEEN ANDERSON, a Notary Public in
4 and for the State of New York, do hereby
5 certify:
6 THAT the foregoing record was taken by me
7 on the 16th day of February, 2017 at the
8 aforesaid time and place, and it is a true and
9 accurate transcript of my stenographic notes.
10 IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my
11 hand this 2nd day of March, 2017.
12
13 
14 KATHLEEN ANDERSON
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

111

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25